WOMEN'S SAFETY IN PUBLIC TRANSPORT
A Pilot Initiative in Bhopal
Report by:
Amit Bhatt
abhatt@embarqindia.org

Ranjana Menon
rmenon@embarqindia.org

Azra Khan
Consultant, WRI India

A Product of
The WRI Ross Center for Sustainable Cities

Disclaimer

This project has been funded by UK aid from the UK government; however the views expressed in the report do not necessarily reflect the UK government’s official policies.
## CONTENTS

**EXECUTIVE SUMMARY** ........................................................................................................... 7

1. **GENDER PERSPECTIVES IN PUBLIC TRANSPORT** ................................................................. 9
   1.1 GENDER DIFFERENCES ........................................................................................................ 9
   1.2 THE ECONOMIC RATIONALE ............................................................................................. 10

2. **PROJECT PURPOSE & APPROACH** ....................................................................................... 11

3. **PROJECT METHODOLOGY** .................................................................................................. 13
   3.1 LITERATURE REVIEW ........................................................................................................ 14
   3.2 SITUATIONAL ANALYSIS .................................................................................................. 14
   3.3 CAPACITY BUILDING AND AWARENESS CREATION ....................................................... 16

4. **INDIAN SCENARIO** ................................................................................................................ 19
   4.1 WOMEN AND PUBLIC TRANSPORT ................................................................................. 19

5. **BHOPAL SCENARIO** ............................................................................................................... 22
   5.1 GENDER PERSPECTIVE ..................................................................................................... 22
   5.2 PUBLIC TRANSPORT SYSTEM IN BHOPAL .................................................................. 23

6. **FINDINGS** ............................................................................................................................... 24

7. **RECOMMENDATIONS** ........................................................................................................... 35
   7.1 PHASE 1 SOLUTIONS ......................................................................................................... 39
      7.1.1 Manager - Women’s Safety and Security .................................................................. 39
      7.1.2 Stop on Request Program ......................................................................................... 40
      7.1.3 Gender Sensitivity Training ..................................................................................... 41
      7.1.4 Women Safety Campaign ........................................................................................ 42
      7.1.5 Redesigning Priority Stretches ................................................................................ 43
      7.1.6 Redesigning Priority Bus Stops ................................................................................ 43
   7.2 PHASE 2 SOLUTIONS ............................................................................................................ 45
      7.2.1 Women Safety Committee ....................................................................................... 45
      7.2.2 Safe City Standing Committee ................................................................................ 47
      7.2.3 Women Employees ..................................................................................................... 48
      7.2.4 Special Bus Passes for Women ................................................................................ 49
      7.2.5 More Nirbhaya Vans .................................................................................................. 50
      7.2.6 Protocols for Fitness Certificate ............................................................................... 51
      7.2.7 Police Women’s Help Line ....................................................................................... 52
   7.3 PHASE 3 SOLUTIONS .............................................................................................................. 53
      7.3.1 Protocols for Bus Contract Specifications ................................................................. 53
      7.3.2 Protocols for Licensing ............................................................................................. 54
      7.3.3 Provision of Bus Shelter ........................................................................................... 55
      7.3.4 Protocols for Bus Stop Placement ............................................................................ 56
      7.3.5 Common Data Base .................................................................................................... 57
8. END LINE ........................................................................................................................................58
9. CONCLUSION ....................................................................................................................................61
Bibliography .........................................................................................................................................62
Annexure
Annexure 1 – Validation Workshop Details
Annexure 2 – Literature Review
Annexure 3 – Safety Audits
Annexure 4 – Drivers and Conductors Training
Annexure 5 – Campaign Report
Annexure 6 – Selection of Pilot Corridors
List of Figures

Figure 1 Impact of Violence against Women in Public Transport ............................................. 10
Figure 2 Project Methodology ............................................................................................. 14
Figure 3 Activities Undertaken for Situational Analysis ......................................................... 14
Figure 4 Safety Audits along Selected Pilot Corridors ............................................................ 16
Figure 5 Capacity Building and Awareness Creation Activities ............................................... 16
Figure 6 Driver & Conductor Trainings ............................................................................... 17
Figure 7 Signature Campaign .............................................................................................. 18
Figure 8 Exhibition at Bus Stops ......................................................................................... 18
Figure 9 Central Government Funding for Women Safety in Public Transport ....................... 19
Figure 10 CCTV Cameras in Delhi ....................................................................................... 20
Figure 11 Women-Only Buses in Meerut ............................................................................. 20
Figure 12 GPS Tracking Device in Shimla .......................................................................... 20
Figure 13 Women Only Compartments in Delhi ................................................................. 20
Figure 14 Reserved Seats for Women in Shimla ................................................................ 20
Figure 15 Emergency Numbers in Bhopal ......................................................................... 20
Figure 16 Citizen Cop - A Mobile Application by Bhopal Police ......................................... 21
Figure 17 Trip Purpose ....................................................................................................... 24
Figure 18 Travel with Dependents ..................................................................................... 24
Figure 19 Travel Expenditure ............................................................................................ 24
Figure 20 Frequency ........................................................................................................... 25
Figure 21 Trip Chaining ..................................................................................................... 25
Figure 22 Choice of Mode ................................................................................................. 25
Figure 23 Condition of Footpaths ...................................................................................... 26
Figure 24 Street Lighting and Condition of Bus Stops ............................................................ 26
Figure 25 Bus Stop with Pole ............................................................................................. 27
Figure 26 Bus Stop without Shelter/ Pole .......................................................................... 27
Figure 27 Condition of CCTV Cameras and Emergency Numbers Displayed in Buses .......... 28
Figure 28 Tampered Emergency Numbers ..................................................................... 28
Figure 29 Level of Harassment in Public Transport ............................................................... 28
Figure 30 Misperception on Harassment ........................................................................ 29
Figure 31 Public Transport Journey .................................................................................. 29
Figure 32 Problems at Different Legs of the Public Transport Journey ............................... 30
Figure 33 Issues Pertaining to Specific Journey Legs .......................................................... 32
Figure 34 Issues Pertaining to Entire Journey ................................................................... 33
Figure 35 Categories .......................................................................................................... 35
Figure 36 Categorization of Issues .................................................................................... 36
Figure 37 Recommendations ............................................................................................. 36
Figure 38 Manager - Women’s Safety and Security ............................................................... 39
Figure 39 Stop on Request Programme ............................................................................... 40
Figure 40 Gender Sensitivity Training ............................................................................... 41
Figure 41 Women Safety Campaign ................................................................................... 42
Figure 42 Redesigning Priority Stretches .......................................................................... 44
Figure 43 Women’s Safety Committee ............................................................................... 45
Figure 44 Safe City Standing Committee ......................................................................... 47
Figure 45 Women Employees ............................................................................................ 48
Figure 46 Special Bus Passes for Women ............................................................................ 49
Figure 47 More Nirbhaya Vans .......................................................................................... 50
Figure 48 Protocols for Fitness Certificate .......................................................................... 51
Figure 49 Police Women's Help Line ................................................................................ 52
Figure 50 Protocols for Bus Contracts Specifications .......................................................... 53
Figure 51 Protocols for Licensing ..................................................................................... 54
Figure 52 Provision of Bus Shelter .................................................................................... 55
Figure 53 Protocols for Bus Stop Placement ..................................................................... 56
Figure 54 Redesigning Priority Bus Stops ........................................................................ 43
Figure 55 Common Data Base ........................................................................................... 57
List of Tables

Table 1 Phasing of the Projects .............................................................. 8
Table 2 List of Key Stakeholders ............................................................. 15
Table 3 Modal Share in Bhopal ................................................................. 23
Table 4 Priority Stretches ..................................................................... 33
Table 5 Priority 1 Bus Stops ................................................................. 34
Table 6 Phasing of the Projects ............................................................. 38
Table 7 Proposed Bus Stop Design Guidelines .................................. 44
Table 8 Before and After Analysis of Training .................................. 58
Table 9 Phase 1 Status ....................................................................... 60
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The need for the study

Studies from around the world have shown that women’s travel patterns are different from that of men. Women tend to travel more during off peak hours; more often with dependents; and stop at multiple points on a single trip (trip-chaining), to list a few differences. Data collected by Public transport agencies are however not gender disaggregated in India. This has resulted in a failure of public transport to address the travel needs of women commuters completely.

Recent literature has also showed that lack of safety is one of the reasons for falling employment rates among women in the country. Lack of safety leads to woman restricting their movement. When the lack of safety is felt while using public transport the impact is much bigger. Since public transport is used as a means to access economic and social opportunities, the lack of safety in public transport can have wider impacts on a woman’s life.

The Project

This project is a pilot intervention to improve women’s safety and comfort in public bus transport in Bhopal. The project is part of Government of UK Department for International Development’s (DFID) support to Government of Madhya Pradesh (GoMP).

The objective of this project was to create an Action Plan to ensure Women’s Safety in Public Transport in the city of Bhopal. The project aims to identify and address the unidentified needs and problems of women commuters of public transport. The concerns of women are incorporated into policy-making, planning, operations and contracting of Public transport in the city of Bhopal. Gender Mainstreaming has been followed as the approach in this project.

Key Findings

The project involved understanding the current public transport scenario in Bhopal and in particular, the experience of women commuters. Data collected highlighted the following key findings:

- A short supply of public transport infrastructure;
- Difference in the travel patterns of women and men;
- High level of harassment of women who use public transport; and
- Limited understanding of harassment among public transport personnel.
- Limited economic capacity of women commuters as compared to male commuters
- Discontinuity and mismanagement of past projects, which address women’s issues

The project highlighted that the issues faced by women commuters of public transport are multi-dimensional.

Recommendations

EMBARQ India proposes a full-fledged Gender Program for the city of Bhopal. This program will include solutions in four categories:
• Institutional Capacity- To address continuity and management of projects. It also addresses representation of women at all levels of planning and operation in public transport. Example: Appointment of Manager Safety and Security & hiring of female employees on ground operations.

• Public Transport Planning and Operations- To ensure that the concerns of women commuters are incorporated into planning and operations of public transport. Example: Stop on request programme, Special bus pass for women, etc.

• Public Transport Infrastructure and Vehicles- To ensure that concerns of women are incorporated into the design of both public transport infrastructure such as bus stops but also the rolling stock that is buses. Example: Women friendly design of buses, etc.

• Enforcement and Grievance System- Solutions which are concerned with the systems that women can approach in case a problem arises. Example: Availability of patrol vehicles, helpline numbers, etc.

Since public transport planning, policy and operations are not entirely under the jurisdiction of a single agency; multiple agencies including the municipal corporation, police and RTO are to be involved in implementation of the program along with the public transport agency in the city.

The program has to be implemented over three phases. While the priority and base projects are recommended for Phase 1, projects which are based on the implementation of other projects are recommended for Phase 2 and 3 (Table 1).

Table 1 Phasing of the Projects

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Phase</th>
<th>Phase 1</th>
<th>Phase 2</th>
<th>Phase 3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Manager- Women's safety</td>
<td>Women Safety Committee</td>
<td>Protocols for Bus Contract</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Stop on Request Program</td>
<td>Safe City Standing Committee</td>
<td>Specifications</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Gender Sensitivity Training</td>
<td>Women Employees</td>
<td>Protocols for Licensing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Women Safety Campaign</td>
<td>Special Bus Passes for Women</td>
<td>Provision of Bus Shelters</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Redesigning priority stretches</td>
<td>More Nirbhaya Vans</td>
<td>Common Data base</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Redesigning Priority Bus stops</td>
<td>Protocols for Fitness Certificate</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Police Women’s Help Line</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

This project is one of the very few initiatives in India to undertake a comprehensive study on the lack of safety for women in public transport and the associated concerns related to public transport policy, design, planning and operations. The proposed Gender Program/ Action Plan, when adopted by the stakeholders, can aid in improving the safety, security and the quality of public transport for women in Bhopal.
1. GENDER PERSPECTIVES IN PUBLIC TRANSPORT

POOR UNDERSTANDING OF WOMEN’S NEEDS IN TRANSPORT

1.1 GENDER DIFFERENCES

“It is widely acknowledged that women’s travel patterns are different from men’s, and these differences are characterized by persistent inequalities. Within any given urban setting, women have inferior access to both private and public means of transport while at the same time assuming a higher share of their household’s travel burden and making more trips associated with reproductive and caretaking responsibilities” (Peters 2013). “The difficulties faced by women with regard to their mobility are a form of social exclusion which affects all aspects of their lives and in particular hinders their economic output and health” (Duchene 2011).

Studies from around the world show that women depend more on public transport than men, especially when they are part of the lower income strata.

- In France, two-thirds of public transit passengers are women
- In the United States in 2007, 55% of public transit passengers were women
- In Germany, women use public transport more than men

This however does not translate to availability of public transport services, which cater to the specific needs of women commuters. The off-peak and peripheral public transit routes that women depend on for their travel to shopping or social facilities often have less priority than the radial commuter corridors that connect directly to the city centre.

---

1 Gender Equality Initiatives in Transportation Policy, Yael Hasson and Marianna Polevoy, July 2011
2 Demand for Public Transport in Germany and the USA: An Analysis of Rider Characteristics, RALPH BUEHLER AND JOHN PUCHER, 2012
In addition, the complex household and caretaking responsibilities of women usually force them to make multiple stops during a single trip. A phenomenon which is popularly referred to as 'trip-chaining'. This makes the trip costlier for women, as they may have to pay numerous single-fare tickets during such a chained trip (Peters 2013). As women’s travel is characterized by trip chaining, the most predominant mode of travel for low-income women in developing countries is walking (Peters 2013).

Studies have also shown that trips made by women are not only characterised by off peak-hour trips and trip chaining but also involve a higher probability of carrying packages or being accompanied by dependents (UN Women 2010).

These factors together make women even more vulnerable to harassment as standard public transport services do not account for their specific needs. Globally, women specific barriers to safe public transport include fear and experiences of sexual harassment and violence while accessing and using public transport. Overcrowding, lack of space and information, delay or unreliable public transport services have a disproportionately higher impact on women than men.

Data collected by public transport authorities in India are however not gender disaggregated to identify neither share of women commuters in public transport nor to identify their enablers and barriers (affordability, accessibility, information, safety and security), which impede their access to public transport. This failure of transport systems in understanding the needs of women commuters and the impact of transport systems on women’s lives has led to the issues remaining unaddressed.

1.2 THE ECONOMIC RATIONALE

Recent studies have shown the correlation between violence against women and women’s work force participation. A survey of non-working women in Delhi showed that ‘lack of safety’ was one of the biggest reasons for their decision to not enter the formal workforce. Another report by Chakraborty et al in 2014 stated that women would be less likely to participate in the labour force when perceived threat of crime against them is high, and this deterrent effect is likely to be stronger in traditional societies.

Women tend to avoid places/ locations, which are known to be unsafe or which they perceive to be unsafe. That is, the presence of threat or even the perception of threat leads a woman to self- restrict her movement. Freedom of movement is one of the biggest casualties of violence against women in public spaces.

When harassment happens in a public transport system, the impact is not restricted to their use of public transport facilities alone. The impact is amplified because it directly affects their access to economic, social and health opportunities, given the role of transport in providing access. That is, when women stop using public transport, due of lack of safety, it severely impacts their mobility and thus access to any opportunities (Figure 1). Also, considering that women have traditionally played the role of the primary caretaker of children and elderly at home, the lack of freedom of movement for women could impact the whole family and thus cause heavier economic impacts (UNESCAP 2014).

![Figure 1](image) Impact of Violence against Women in Public Transport

To ensure increased presence of women in economic activities, availability of safe and reliable transport services is not just desirable but mandatory. For ensuring safe transport services, it is necessary that gender concerns are mainstreamed into all aspects of public transport planning and operations.
2. PROJECT PURPOSE & APPROACH

ENABLING SAFE AND SECURE TRAVEL FOR WOMEN IN PUBLIC TRANSPORT

This project is a pilot intervention to improve women’s safety in public transport in Bhopal. It is an initiative under DFID support to Government of Madhya Pradesh (GoMP) as part of the Madhya Pradesh Urban Infrastructure Investment Project (MPUIIP). Bhopal Municipal Corporation (BMC), Bhopal City Link Limited (BCLL), Municipal Strengthening Unit (MSU) and the Urban Administration and Development Department (UADD), GoMP, are the principal recipients of the proposed support.

The objective of this study is to create an action plan that enables safe and secure travel for women in public transport in Bhopal and address their unmet needs. Further, it aims to mainstream gender concerns in future planning, contracting and policy-making processes in public transport.

For the purpose of the project, the definition of a public transport trip is not only limited to travel within a public transport vehicle. The definition has been broadened to include (1) access and egress trips; (2) wait times at public transport stops; (3) vehicle boarding and alighting; and (4) journey inside the vehicle. Attention has been given to ensure that the Action Plan is holistic and that it considers all possible solutions. The Plan also identifies key stakeholders in the city and their role in addressing the issues.

The project was broken down into three stages:

The **inception stage** of the study, involved studying the transport scenario in Bhopal, selecting the pilot routes (one trunk route, standard route and three mini bus routes) for a detailed study, a reconnaissance survey along the selected routes, selection of key project stakeholders, reference case studies and creating the survey and interview formats.

The **interim stage** of the study included a review of selected case studies, stakeholder consultations and detailed analysis of Bhopal’s public transport scenario through safety audits, infrastructure surveys and interviews of public transport commuters. This stage also involved capacity building for bus personnel and a women’s safety campaign in the city to build awareness on the issue.
The **final stage** of the study involved developing an Action Plan for the city of Bhopal based on the key findings from the Interim stage. The action plans details the recommendations for the city and the authorities and key stakeholders responsible for implementation. The plan also took into account both formal and informal transport modes. These recommendations were then presented to the important stakeholders in the city for their input and validation in a workshop[^1] held in April, 2015. The discussions and suggestions from this workshop have been incorporated into the final set of recommendations and presented in this report.

[^1]: Validation Workshop on Women’s Safety in Public Transport- Details are given in Annexure
3. PROJECT METHODOLOGY

MAINSTREAMING GENDER CONCERNS IN PUBLIC TRANSPORT PLANNING & OPERATIONS

The project focuses on mainstreaming gender concerns in public transport planning and operations. The proposed methodology (Figure 2) is tied to the project milestones and deliverables as per programme reporting guidelines.

In accordance with the above objectives, the project methodology comprises of three stages/focus areas:

1. **Literature Review** – To study and understand the paradigm around women safety concerns in public transport globally and best practices adopted globally to ensure safer travel for women commuters worldwide.

2. **Situation Analysis** – To understand the travel patterns of women commuters, along with identifying key problems faced by women while using public transport.

3. **Capacity Building and Awareness Creation** – To emphasize the need of gender sensitization and women’s safety in the city of Bhopal.
3.1. LITERATURE REVIEW

The study identified 7 cities within and outside India, which have actively looked at the gender aspect in public transport or safety of women in public spaces. The problems faced by these cities and steps taken to address these problems were then studied with an intent to compile best practices in the field.

Academic reports on gender and public transport were also studied as a part of the literature review to understand the essential differences in travel patterns of men and women. This information was then used by the project team to define the paradigm/ framework of the project.

3.2. SITUATIONAL ANALYSIS

Situational analysis was undertaken to understand the current public transport scenario in the city of Bhopal. Various activities as indicated in Figure 3 were undertaken to study the travel patterns on men and women, perception of commuters and quality of public transport infrastructure. The situational analysis exercise thus helped in capturing a snapshot of the existing situation of the city.
Figure 3 Activities Undertaken for Situational Analysis

a. Stakeholder Consultation (timeline – August, 2015 to September 2015)

A core group of stakeholders comprising of government and private organisations and related to public transport planning or operations/ with women’s safety in the city were identified (Table 2). Officials from these agencies were then interviewed to understand the issues and challenges in the city and the steps that have been taken to address these issues. Suggestions on steps that could be taken to improve the current scenario and making the city safer for women were also discussed.

Table 2 List of Key Stakeholders

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S. No.</th>
<th>Stakeholders</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Bhopal City Link Limited (BCLL)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Bhopal Municipal Corporation (BMC)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Urban Administration and Development Department (UADD)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Police</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Traffic Police</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>Women and Child Development Department</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.</td>
<td>Educational Institutes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.</td>
<td>Advocacy organizations working on women safety issues</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

b. Baseline Survey

Surveys of both male and female commuters along the 8 selected pilot corridors were conducted to understand their travel patterns and their daily travel experiences. The survey also sought to specifically understand the safety concerns of women commuters. A total of 1998 commuters were surveyed for this analysis. The survey questionnaire included questions on demography, trip characteristics and commuter experience including their perception of women safety.

c. Rapid Assessment

4 Details on selection of corridors given in Annexure 6
Rapid assessment was undertaken to assess the present condition of infrastructure along the 8 pilot corridors. Accessibility, provision of public transport and street infrastructure were some of the parameters studied. The rapid assessment survey consisted of 4 categories:

1. Route details
2. Footpath along the route
3. Bus shelters
4. Public transport vehicles

d. **Boarding and Alighting Counts**

Counts analysis of passengers along selected pilot corridors was conducted through boarding and alighting surveys. The analysis was undertaken to understand the time popularity and stop popularity along the 8 routes for male and female commuters. The analysis also helped in route comparison to understand popular routes among women in Bhopal.

e. **Driver and Conductor Interviews**

As a part of the situational analysis, drivers and conductors from the selected pilot corridors were also interviewed. The interviews focused on understanding the level of gender sensitivity and awareness about sexual harassment. The interviews also tried to capture their preparedness to address and/or respond to instances of sexual harassment within their respective modes of transport and the standard operating procedures adopted for safety of women.

A total of 186 drivers and 71 bus conductors were interviewed on the selected pilot corridors. The results and learnings from the interviews are explained in the following sections.

f. **Safety Audits**

Safety audits of the selected pilot corridors and bus stops along these routes were conducted (Figure 4) by means of a mobile based application called ‘Safetipin’. Safetipin is a map-based mobile phone application that lets users rate any location on a set of 9 parameters. These 9 parameters, which include: lighting, openness, visibility, crowd, security, walk path, public transport, gender diversity and feeling of safety; together contribute to safety. Each audit results in a pin on the specific location where the audit was performed. Every pin is denoted by three different colours depending on the input: Red indicates an unsafe location, amber indicates a slightly safer location and green indicates a safe location.

As data on harassment and eve teasing are highly underreported, safety audits act as a valuable proxy in understanding the perception of people and greatly help in getting a better idea of the situation on-ground.

---

5 Eve Teasing- Public sexual harassment or molestation (often known as "street harassment") of women by men
3.3. CAPACITY BUILDING AND AWARENESS CREATION

For capacity building and awareness generation, two activities as illustrated in Figure 5 were undertaken.

![Figure 5](Capacity Building and Awareness Creation Activities)

a. Training of Drivers & Conductors

Trainings and sensitization of bus drivers and conductors on gender and women’s safety were undertaken (Figure 6) on 23rd, 24th and 25th January, 2015. The trainings were conducted by a local women’s organisation, Sangini along with the support from the Police Department, and aimed to help drivers and conductors understand and identify various types of harassment, increase awareness about existing laws with regard to women’s rights, improve the interaction with women passengers and increasing their personal commitment to prevent harassment of passengers especially women. The trainings also focussed on the appropriate steps that can be taken by ground personnel in case of an incident on a bus.

![Figure 6](Driver & Conductor Trainings)
Though the activity was centred towards capacity building of ground personnel, there were key takeaways from these activities which have helped in building a greater understanding of the issue of women’s safety and thus contributed to the framing of the final recommendations.

b. Advocacy Campaign

A one week advocacy campaign, headed by Sangini, a local NGO with support from BCLL to improve women’s safety, create awareness on sexual harassment and violence against women in public transport was undertaken in May, 2015. The campaign included both on-ground activities as well as activities on the social media to ensure maximum outreach and coverage. Various activities such as exhibitions at bus stops, signature campaigns, and talk shows with police and role plays in the buses were undertaken (Figure 7 and 8). Public feedback on the same was recorded as a source of information for later stages in the project.

![Signature Campaign](image1)

**Figure 7** Signature Campaign

![Exhibition at Bus Stops](image2)

**Figure 8** Exhibition at Bus Stops
4. INDIAN SCENARIO

AD HOC SELECTION OF PROJECTS

4.1. WOMEN AND PUBLIC TRANSPORT

Since December 2012, women’s safety in public transport has gained a lot of media and political attention. Some of the key initiatives undertaken by GOI has been listed in Figure 9.

- **2012**: Verma Committee constituted
- **2013**: Union Budget 2013- INR 1000 crores (Nirbhaya Fund)
- **2014**: Union Budget 2014- INR 200 crores
- **2015**: Union Budget- INR 2000 crores (Nirbhaya Fund)

*Figure 9* Central Government Funding for Women Safety in Public Transport
As illustrated in Figure 9, INR 1000 crores were allotted in 2013 under the Nirbhaya Fund. However, as Dennis S. Jesudasan noted in The Hindu article ‘Rs. 800 cr. of Nirbhaya Fund lying unused’ on March 16, 2015 - more than INR 800 crores of this budget got lapsed since there were no ministries or city governments who applied for the funds. There has however been a continued interest from the GOI to allot funds for this issue. In 2015, INR 2000 crores was allotted for the Nirbhaya Fund (Press Information Bureau, GOI 2014).

Figure 10 to Figure 16 showcases some of the most common solutions implemented till date in Indian cities by various cities.

**Figure 10** CCTV Cameras in Delhi  
**Figure 11** Women-Only Buses in Meerut

**Figure 12** GPS Tracking Device in Shimla  
**Figure 13** Women Only Compartments in Delhi

**Figure 14** Reserved Seats for Women in Shimla  
**Figure 15** Emergency Numbers in Bhopal
Based on the research conducted on the initiatives undertaken by GOI and city governments in India, the following conclusions can be drawn:

- **Excess Focus on Technology-Centric Solutions:** Proposals and solutions that have currently been implemented are technology-centric, even though the Verma Committee Report discusses other solutions.

- **Knowledge Gap:** Solutions currently implemented by cities are on an ad hoc basis, without a complete understanding of the issues.

- **Underutilisation of Funds:** Funds allocated to address women safety in public transport has been underutilised due to the reasons mentioned earlier.

Indian cities will benefit from guidance on choosing the right measures for their context and better utilisation of the new round of Nirbhaya Funds.

---

**Figure 16** Citizen Cop - A Mobile Application by Bhopal Police
5. BHOPAL SCENARIO

HUGE GENDER GAP IN ECONOMIC PARTICIPATION

5.1. GENDER PERSPECTIVE

The female work force participation rate in Bhopal was 10.3% while it was 46.9% for men in 2001. According to the Development Report of Madhya Pradesh, almost 80% of urban women workers were in unorganized sectors like household industries such as petty trades and services, building and construction.

Women are the primary earners in their households for around 8.4% households (Bhopal Municipal Corporation 2005). 90% of the women in Bhopal are either students (42%) or housewives (48%) with only 5% in the service industry (Bhopal Municipal Corporation 2012). This indicates that the city has a huge gender gap in economic participation.

Data by National Crime Records Bureau also indicates that Madhya Pradesh had the highest number of rapes and molestation cases with more than 4300 rapes and 8200 molestation cases reported in 2013 (National Crime Records Bureau, GOI 2013).

The situation in Bhopal is similar to the rest of the state. In a study conducted by the Sangini Resource Institute with women/girl respondents in Bhopal in 2013 (Sangini Gender Resource Centre 2013) on women’s safety concerns in public spaces, the following observations were made:

- A significant number of women and girls faced harassment and/or violence during the day, particularly in the afternoon and in crowded spaces such as bus stops and markets.
- The main reasons of women and girls not reporting such incidents are - fear of their reputation and lack of faith in the police.

Several newspaper articles have highlighted that women within the service industry preferred to not work rather than work late due to lack of safe commuting options (Sharma 2014); men tend to “misbehave” with women because of “poor” security systems; girl students particularly felt vulnerable in reporting the incidents; that men staring make women commuters uncomfortable and that help is not available from bystanders (M.Poomina 2012).
5.2. PUBLIC TRANSPORT SYSTEM IN BHOPAL

Bhopal’s public transport system consists of a Bus Rapid Transit System (BRTS) implemented from 2013, three trunk and eight standard bus services, mini-buses, auto-rickshaws as well as Tata Magics. There are 2.4 million trips made per day with 43% walking and 23% by standard and mini-bus mode shares (Bhopal Municipal Corporation 2012). According to the 2012 Comprehensive Mobility Plan (CMP), 37% of public transport users are women.

In terms of ridership, Tata Magics has the highest share followed by buses run under the jurisdiction of BCLL and then mini buses. Informal modes of transport (tata magic and mini buses) cater to 68% of total public transport ridership and the remaining 32% is being catered by the formal modes (Table 3).

In terms of ridership by mode, Tata Magics make up the highest share followed by BCLL and mini buses. Informal modes of transport (Tata Magic+ Mini buses) cater to 68% of total public transport ridership and the remaining 32% is being catered by the formal modes.

**Table 3 Modal Share in Bhopal**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Mode of Transport</th>
<th>Average daily Ridership</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Formal Mode</td>
<td>Red Bus</td>
<td>1,00,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informal Mode</td>
<td>Mini Bus</td>
<td>95000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informal Mode</td>
<td>Tata Magic</td>
<td>1,20,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Daily Public Transport Ridership</td>
<td></td>
<td>3,15,000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Bhopal City Link Limited, 2014

Mini bus fares in the city are regulated by the Transport Department. While the government regulated fares of mini buses are the same as standard non A/C buses, mini bus operators informally charge lesser rates to attract passengers. The typical minimum fare is Rs. 5, with a Rs. 1 increase with each successive distance slab. However, the actual fares charged depends on the individual operator.

In the case of tata magic vehicles, the fare structure is even more informal compared to mini buses. Discussions with tata magic operators reveal that tata magics operators charge fares lower than mini buses and BCLL buses to attract passengers to their service.

In terms of scheduling, the Regional Transport Office (RTO) in Bhopal does not prescribe any time-table or schedules for mini bus or tata magic operations. The informal modes operate for longer working hours, typically 12-14 hours per day, which is longer than the standard buses, which operate around 8-12 hours.
6. FINDINGS

This section highlights some key findings from the activities carried out as part of situational analysis.

I. TRAVEL PATTERNS OF WOMEN ARE DIFFERENT FROM MEN

a. Trip Purpose

Around 60% of the total trips made by men were work trips while work trips for women were around 33%. Women had a higher share of trips (35%) made for education, i.e. attending classes when compared to men (20%). (Figure 17)

Figure 17 Trip Purpose

b. Travel with Dependents

More than 30% of the women responded that they tend to travel with dependents, with only 16% of men responding they do so (Figure 18).

Figure 18 Travel with Dependents

c. Travel Expenditure

70% of the people surveyed mentioned that monthly household travel expenditure for women is less than men (Figure 19). This was in sync with the data collected on monthly transport expenditure for men and women. 60% of men spend more than Rs.1000/ month on transport whereas most women (54%) spend less than Rs. 1000/month transport. A majority of the women (27%) mentioned incurring an expense of Rs. 500-750/month.

Figure 19 Travel Expenditure

d. Frequency

94% of the total trips made by men were conducted on a daily basis (Figure 20), trips. For women, only 87% of the trips were made on a daily basis. This could be explained by the fact that women travel a lot
less than men for work and more than men for purposes such as shopping, recreation and religious purposes, which do not happen on a daily basis.

![Frequency: 94% total trips made by men on an everyday basis, for women it was only 87%](image)

**Figure 20** Frequency

e. **Trip Chaining**

Train Chaining refers to a phenomenon where a single trip consists of multiple stops and not just a single stop. While a trip is traditionally defined by a single origin and destination, trip chaining adds other points to the journey in addition to the origin and final destination.

More than 60% of men generally tend to travel from an origin to a destination, without any trip chaining. Around 50% women undertake multiple activities per trip, leading to multiple stops (Figure 21). This could be explained by the fact that women tend to travel more often with dependents and also because of the activities that women generally undertake as shown by the data on trip purpose.

![Figure 21 Trip Chaining](image)

f. **Reason for Mode Choice**

Cost of travel has been rated the most prevalent criteria for choice of mode by both men and women. This is not surprising given users of public transport are generally captive users in India, i.e. users who do not have access to other mode of transport. This also explains why Tata Magics with the lowest fares have the highest modal share within public transport of the city.

![Figure 22 Choice of Mode](image)
The second most common criteria were time of travel for men but safety for women. More than 20% women mentioned safety as their top priority when choosing the mode of transport (Figure 22).

II. POOR STATE OF PUBLIC TRANSPORT INFRASTRUCTURE

The analysis of the existing state of infrastructure revealed there are gaps in the provision of infrastructure both in terms of street infrastructure and vehicles and buses.

While wide footpaths are available along the routes of the standard bus service, the height of the footpath is too high for comfort. Footpath height at most places is 2.5 times the recommended standard by IRC and hence is inconvenient to use (Figure 23). The IRC guidelines recommend a minimum width of 60 inches and a height of 6 inches for the footpaths.

This was reflected in the public transport user surveys, where 24% of the regular bus users complained either of insufficient footpaths or that the footpaths were obstructed around the bus stop. Along, the mini buses and Tata magic routes, footpaths were missing all along the routes.

Footpaths are mostly not present. When present, footpath height is 2.5 times the recommended standard.

Figure 23 Condition of Footpaths

96% bus shelters were poorly lit and were not clearly visible in the dark. Around 50% of bus stops along standard routes did not have bus shelters (Figure 24, Figure 25 and Figure 26).

Figure 24 Street Lighting and Condition of Bus Stops
Figure 25 Bus Stop with Pole

Figure 26 Bus Stop without Shelter/ Pole
Vehicles: While all standard buses were provided with 2 CCTVs, the situational analysis highlighted that less than 75% of them were operational. 3 buses on SR5 and 2 on TR1 did not display the emergency numbers and in buses, where the numbers were displayed, they were tampered with. (Figure 27 and Figure 28). In case of Tata Magics and mini buses, safety features such as CCTVs, display of emergency numbers and route maps were not present.

Figure 27 Condition of CCTV Cameras and Emergency Numbers Displayed in Buses

Figure 28 Tampered Emergency Numbers

III. HIGH LEVEL OF HARASSMENT

Around 40% of the women surveyed reported being harassed on a regular basis while using public transport, including BCLL buses, mini buses and Tata Magics. 88% reported that they were harassed at least once while using public transport (Figure 29). Only 12% reported that they were never harassed while using public transport services.

Figure 29 Level of Harassment in Public Transport
IV. MISPERCEPTION ON HARASSMENT

From the interviews of drivers and conductors, it is evident that an understanding of harassment is narrow and most feel that public transport is safe for women. Almost all the drivers and conductors interviewed were of the opinion that women harassment was not a prevalent issue in Bhopal. 30% of drivers & conductors believed that women were equally responsible for the harassment (Figure 30).

![Figure 30 Misperception on Harassment](image)

However, a large number of the respondents (86%) expressed willingness to undertake training to understand gender sensitive issues. As per the interested respondents the main messages in the trainings should be

- What men should do to ensure women are safe and to handle situations of harassment in the most effective manner
- How to eliminate misconceptions of men about women and assist in their progress
- Men should be taught how to be responsible towards women safety

V. DIFFERENT JOURNEY LEGS CHARACTERISED BY DIFFERENT TYPES OF PROBLEMS

A public transport journey comprises of multiple stages starting from origin to destination. The entire public transport journey experience from origin to destination can be divided into four segments as explained in Figure 31 below.

![Figure 31 Public Transport Journey](image)

Figure 32 illustrates case study of a women commuter using public transport.
Figure 32 Problems at Different Legs of the Public Transport Journey
Source: EMBARQ India
Most common complaint across modes has been the lack of information on whom to contact in case of harassment or an emergency. Insufficient seats for women and lack of enforcement of women only seat were also pointed as important problems by women commuters. While this was expected in Tata Magics where no seats are reserved for women, it was surprising to see this come up as an issue even on TR1 and Mini buses were seats are reserved for women. This only makes us conclude that the number of seats reserved for women needs to be correlated with the number of women passengers on the route and not just on the capacity of the vehicle and that unless the seat reservation policy is enforced correctly, the policy does not help women passengers.

Women commuters were of the opinion that training of conductors should focus on training them on intervening when a women gets harassed in a bus, ensuring enforcement of reserved seats for women and waiting patiently for women and elderly to board and alight the vehicle. Drivers were to be trained to ensure that the gap between bus and platform is reduced & sudden braking of the vehicle be avoided.

Based on the travel experiences shared by women commuters, issues specific to each of the four journey legs of the public transport journey were identified (Figure 33).
Figure 33 Issues Pertaining to Specific Journey Legs
VI. SOME PROBLEMS ARE RELATED TO THE ENTIRE JOURNEY

The ecosystem issues as identified from the situational analysis and travel experiences of women commuters were those pertaining to broader aspects (Figure 34) and concerns which impact the entire public transport journey.

VII. PRIORITY PUBLIC TRANSPORT STOPS AND STRETCHES

Safety audits were conducted using the Safetipin app along the pilot corridors in the city. The audits helped in identifying the stretches on the corridor and bus stops, which were unsafe. The safety audits rates a location based on 9 parameters which includes availability of light, land use pattern and gendered use of the space. This exercise helped in identifying the stretches (Table 4) and bus stops on the corridor (Priority 1 bus stops are listed below in Table 5 and for Priority 2 bus stops see Annexure on safety Audits), which have to be prioritised by the municipal corporation and the public transport agency to improve safety.

The identified locations are given in table 4 and 5 below.

These stretches on the selected corridors which scored least in terms of safety and were identified as priority stretches (Table 4). Apart from these, bus stops along the selected pilot corridors were also audited and priority bus stops were identified based on the safety scores (Priority 1 are listed below in Table 5 and for Priority 2 bus stops see Annexure on safety Audits).

Three priority stretches which were identified are listed below.

Table 4 Priority Stretches

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S.No</th>
<th>Start Point</th>
<th>End Point</th>
<th>Other Points on the Route</th>
<th>Length of the corridor</th>
<th>Routes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Kasturba Nagar Bus Stop</td>
<td>Ayodhya Nagar Bus Stop</td>
<td>Vijay Market Bus Stop, Barkhedi</td>
<td>9.00 Km</td>
<td>SR5 &amp; MB5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Civil Hospital Bus Stop</td>
<td>SBI Chauraha Bus Stop</td>
<td>5.21 Km</td>
<td>TR1 &amp; SR5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Airtel Office, Malviya Nagar</td>
<td>DB Mall</td>
<td>3.56 Km</td>
<td>SR5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Table 5 Priority 1 Bus Stops

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S.No</th>
<th>Name of Bus Stop</th>
<th>Route</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Prakash Tarun Pushkar Bus stop</td>
<td>TR1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Kasturba Hospital Bus Stop</td>
<td>SR5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Carrier College Bus Stop</td>
<td>SR5 &amp; TM1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Sanchi Dairy Bus Stop</td>
<td>SR5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Piplani, Sector C, BHEL</td>
<td>MB5 &amp; TM1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Allahabad Bank Bus Stop</td>
<td>MB5 &amp; TM1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Old Subhash Nagar Colony, Raisen Road</td>
<td>MB5 &amp; TM2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Hoshgabad Road</td>
<td>MB7 &amp; MB11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Hoshgabad Road</td>
<td>MB7 &amp; MB11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Jail Road, Zone 1 MP Nagar</td>
<td>MB7 &amp; MB11</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
7. RECOMMENDATIONS

Studying the problems faced by women commuters of public transport, made it clear that the problem was complex and multidimensional. It was not a single problem, while alone contributed to the problems faced by women; rather it was a multitude of factors. The solutions should hence be able to capture this complexity and address it.

EMBARQ India proposes a full-fledged Gender Program for the city of Bhopal to ensure women’s safety in public transport. This program includes a multitude of initiatives, which can be divided into four categories (Figure 35):

a. Institutional Capacity- The capacity of all relevant organisations to understand and address women’s issues.

b. Service Planning and Operations- The manner in which the public transport is planned and operated

c. Infrastructure and Vehicles- The quality and design of Public transport infrastructure like bus stops and public transport vehicles like buses and Tata Magics.

d. Enforcement/Grievance System- The systems in place for ensuring enforcement of measures and access of women to grievance system in case a situation arises.

In the figure 36 below, the key problems, responsible for lack of women’s comfort and safety are listed into the four categories.
The Gender Program recommended by EMBARQ addresses all the issues that have been highlighted in Figure 36. The program includes a wide variety of solutions and this is listed in Figure 37 and Table 6 below.

**Figure 36 Categorization of Issues**

**Gender Program for Bhopal**

**Figure 37 Recommendations**
The recommendations proposed addresses both formal and informal modes of transport. While some recommendations are common for both formal and informal modes a few recommendations are specific to a particular mode.

Some of the important stakeholders that should be involved in the implementation of the program includes: BCLL, BMC, Police, RTO and private operators of buses (regular and mini) and Tata Magics. While BCLL and BMC are mostly responsible for the solutions related to formal modes of transport; the RTO and police are responsible for the solutions related to informal modes.

The Gender Program will have to be implemented in the city in a phased manner (Table 6). While some initiatives have to be taken up on a priority basis, a few others are dependent on some other measures being implemented already. It is suggested that the program be implemented over three phases. Each phase lasting 1 year to 1.5 years.

The details of each of the recommendation including the problem that the recommendation is meant to address and the agency responsible for implementation are explained in detail below.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Phase 1</th>
<th>BCLL</th>
<th>BMC</th>
<th>Police</th>
<th>RTO</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Manager- Women's Safety and Security</td>
<td>Manager- Women's Safety and Security</td>
<td>Gender Sensitivity Training</td>
<td>Manager- Women's Safety and Security</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Stop on Request Program</td>
<td>Redesigning Priority Stretches</td>
<td>Women Safety Campaign</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Gender Sensitivity Training</td>
<td>Redesigning Priority Bus Stops</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Women Safety Campaign</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Redesigning Priority Stretches</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Phase 2</th>
<th>BCLL</th>
<th>BMC</th>
<th>Police</th>
<th>RTO</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Women Safety Committee</td>
<td>Safe City Standing Committee</td>
<td>Safe City Standing Committee</td>
<td>Safe City Standing Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Safe City Standing Committee</td>
<td></td>
<td>More Nirbhaya Vans</td>
<td>Protocols for Fitness Certificate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Women Employees</td>
<td></td>
<td>Police Women’s Help Lines</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Special Bus Passes for Women</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>More Nirbhaya Vans</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Phase 3</th>
<th>BCLL</th>
<th>BMC</th>
<th>Police</th>
<th>RTO</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Protocols for Bus Contract Specifications</td>
<td>Protocols for Bus Stop Placement</td>
<td>Common Data Base</td>
<td>Protocols for Licensing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Protocols for Bus Stop Placement</td>
<td>Provision of Bus Shelters</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Common Data Base</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

There are certain solutions which are common across stakeholders; these have been marked separately under each phase in unique colors.
7.1. PHASE 1 SOLUTIONS

7.1.1. Manager - Women’s Safety and Security

Type of Solution - Institutional Capacity

There is lack of in-house capacity among all the departments related to public transport in the city, in understanding and addressing issues related to women’s safety.

It is hence proposed that all departments improve their current organisational structure by creating a manager level position which specifically looks at safety and security. This position will be responsible for all projects which are related to provision of safety and security of public transport commuters, especially that of women (Figure 38).

For example, currently, there are two Managerial positions within BCLL under the Additional CEO, one for Operations/ Administration and the other one for Engineering. An additional managerial position can be created on women’s safety and security. Similar positions should be created in all departments having stake in the public transport system of the city like BMC, UADD, and RTO etc. The position should ideally be filled by a woman to ensure that a women’s perspective is available. To elaborate, the potential responsibilities of such a position within BCLL would be

a. Risk Assessment/ Gender Safety Audits of Existing and proposed locations for bus stops in Bhopal. Give approval for the location proposed or recommend alternative locations.

b. Approving Design of bus stops- Approving women safe bus stop designs and reviewing the designs regularly (every year). Will coordinate with BMC on the same.

c. Finalising women safety protocols that will have to be followed by private operators who run buses in the city.

d. Designing information on safety of women on public transport and ensuring dissemination of this material at all bus stops and public transport vehicles (buses, Tata Magics, Mini Buses).

e. Yearly campaigns on measures taken by BCLL on women’s safety. Measures taken up by other organisations like the Police and Women and Child Development Department which are relevant to

---

6 Risk Assessment should be carried out using the Safetipin App prepared by Jagori, Delhi. http://safetipin.com/
safety of women in public transport should also be publicized using the campaign. The Campaign material should be made available in both Hindi and English.

f. Creating and Chairing BCCL Women’s Safety Committee - This committee will have representatives from women commuters, women’s group in Bhopal, representatives of public transport drivers and conductors and groups which play a relevant role in women’s safety within BCCL. Any recommendations on women only passes, new routes and other interventions which will directly improve safety and comfort of women passengers will be submitted by Women Committee to the Vigilance and Gender Safety Manager for consideration. The final decision on which interventions will be taken up by BCCL will rest on the Manager.

g. Organising regular checks on bus stops, buses and other public transport vehicles to ensure protocols defined on women safety are being followed.

h. Working with the Police in defining the exact protocol to be followed by bus personnel in case a woman is harassed in a bus and the protocol to be followed to investigate and follow up on incidents within buses and bus stops.

i. Women’s Safety Policy - This office should also be responsible for formulating an internal women’s safety policy for BCCL, which addresses women’s safety within the organisation. The policy should be framed to ensure that the organisation is responsible for providing right and safe working conditions for its women employees and that they have access to a proper redressel system. The Safety Policy should also address the HR policy of the organisation which will help in increasing the number of women within the agency (in all role and positions). A Women Employees- Ladies Grievance Committee can be formed under this policy.

j. Annual survey of women commuters to help understand if new projects/ measures will have to be undertaken by BCCL

Similar roles and responsibilities can be worked out for other departments as well. This Managerial position would be responsible to improve commitment to safety and comfort of its women passengers and to ensure agency wide gender sensitisation and continuity of projects.

7.1.2. Stop on Request Program

Type of Solution - Service Planning & Operations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ISSUE</th>
<th>SOLUTION</th>
<th>RESPONSIBLE AGENCY</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Deserted, Lonely Stretches</td>
<td>Stop on Request</td>
<td>Bhopal City Link Limited (BCCL)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 39 Stop on Request Programme
Location of bus stops along deserted lonely stretches was only one of the problem that was highlighted by women passengers. This becomes a bigger issue for women commuters especially after dark. This directly impacts their movement at this time of the day. This solution helps to decrease the length of access and egress trip of women commuters after dark.

**Guidelines**

- To help increase their confidence in travelling after dark and improving their sense of security, BCLL can provide for a Request Stop Programme from 9pm- 5am, which will reduce the length of women’s access and egress trips.
- Under this programme a woman commuter travelling alone can request to be dropped at any point on the bus route, irrespective of whether there is a bus stop at this point. Similarly, a single woman passenger can hail a bus from any point on the bus route and not just the bus stop (Figure 39).

### 7.1.3. Gender Sensitivity Training

**Type of Solution - Institutional Capacity**

*Figure 40 Gender Sensitivity Training*

Training on women’s safety and gender sensitivity should be made compulsory for all staff of government and private organisations involved in public transport operations (Figure 40). These training sessions need to be provided by the Police. The Manager Vigilance and Women’s safety of BCLL can act the technical advisor in these trainings. The training modules on women’s safety and gender sensitivity can be jointly prepared by the BCLL and Police.

Having the police undertake this training will have a twofold advantage. First, it helps in building the confidence of bus personnel that they have the support of the police department in handling cases of harassment and second, ensuring that all public transport staff, irrespective of which organisation or mode of transport they belong to are trained using the same training modules, ensuring that there will be uniformity in the protocols to be followed.

The training should be provided not just for the ground level staff like drivers and conductors but also to mid-level management in different organisations. The relevant organisations in Bhopal include BCLL, Private bus operators, Mini bus operators, Tata Magic Operators, Cab operators and Auto rickshaw operators.
The training for ground personnel will be different from the training that will be provided to management level staff within any organisation. Ground level staff will have to be trained to understand different forms of harassment and the steps/protocols to be followed in case an incident occurs in their vehicle. Management level staff needs to be trained on the importance of handling women’s issues and in providing support and recognising the effort of ground staff, who have addressed issues on women’s safety on ground according to the protocols defined. Unless there is support from the management the ground level staff will shy away from taking action on ground when it is required.

The training session should also involve representatives from women staff and an organisation which has expertise in handling women’s issue to ensure that a gendered perspective is provided and that the training modules are framed right without giving the wrong message. The trainings should be repeated once every year to ensure that the training remains pertinent and actually leads to behavioural change among the public transport personnel some of the trained personnel can also be designated as trainers in the later years depending on their participation and engagement in the process.

### 7.1.4. Women Safety Campaign

Type of Solution - Institutional Capacity

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ISSUE</th>
<th>SOLUTION</th>
<th>RESPONSIBLE AGENCY</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Lack of Knowledge and Sensitivity Among People</td>
<td>Women Safety Campaign</td>
<td>Bhopal City Link Limited (BCLL) &amp; Police</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

![Figure 41 Women Safety Campaign](image)

88% of woman reported that they have been harassed while using public transport in Bhopal. 40% reported being harassed on regular basis (at least once a week). This indicates how grave and important it is to address this issue.

Campaigns which sensitise people about harassment faced by women and which educate people about existing laws and practices should be undertaken (Figure 41). The focus of the campaigns should be to make people understand that women have equal right of space and movement in the city. The campaign will involve schools, colleges and other establishments where there is a large representation of public transport users.

The campaign can be undertaken on a yearly basis by the office of Vigilance and Women’s Safety, BCLL. BCLL should use the support of popular women’s groups, police, BMC and Women and Child Development Department in the city to help frame the campaign and run it.
7.1.5. Redesigning Priority Stretches

Type of Solution - Infrastructure & Vehicles

7.1.6. Redesigning Priority Bus Stops

Type of Solution – Infrastructure & Vehicles

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ISSUE</th>
<th>SOLUTION</th>
<th>RESPONSIBLE AGENCY</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Unfriendly Bus Stop</td>
<td>Redesigning Priority Bus stops</td>
<td>Bhopal City Link Limited (BCLL) &amp; Bhopal Municipal Corporation (BMC)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Figure 42** Redesigning Priority Bus Stops

None of the bus stops on TR1 route provided route details or even information on the name of the bus stop. Only 67% displayed emergency numbers at the bus stop. With regard to lighting it was found that 96% of the bus shelters were not well lit and hence not clearly visible in the dark. With SR5 stops, it was seen that no stops gave route details, only 6% gave route details and only 35% displayed emergency number. No stops were provided with lighting in the dark.

From the safety audits, priority bus stops have been identified on selected pilot corridors have been identified (Table 5 and Annexure 3). These bus stops can be taken up for redesigning by BMC and BCLL. Over time all the bus can be designed and redesigned based on the proposed guidelines.

BCLL has given design specifications for bus stops which are to be followed by contractors who are issued the contract of building bus stops by BMC. While safety is not explicitly mentioned as a parameter, some of the design elements provide for safety of passengers. There are however a few more elements which can be included in the design of the bus stop by BCLL to ensure that the shelters are designed to provide safety for women commuters.

**Guidelines**

Current and future design of bus shelters could include the parameters which are mentioned below in Table 7 to ensure safety and comfort of women commuters (Figure 54).
Table 7 Proposed Bus Stop Design Guidelines

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Design of Bus shelters</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Transparent bus shelters- To ensure Visibility of passengers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Placement of advertisements and other utilities should not hinder visibility for passengers sitting or standing at the bus stops</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ensure installation of comfortable seats partitioned with hand rests</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provide designated seating for passengers travelling with heavy packages or dependents</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proper signage at the bus stop giving stop name and other route details</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Facilities like public phone booths and panic alarm buttons at the bus stops which are directly connected to Nirbhaya Vans provide by Police</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tamper proof feedback system installed at stations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Information- emergency numbers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CCTV Cameras at bus stops where natural surveillance is not possible</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lighting- to ensure consistency lighting need to be provided not just inside the stop but multiple lights in and around the station is required.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provide public notices on who to contact to report burnt out or damaged lights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Real time displays with information about the bus routes, timings, bus stop names.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ensure placement of women commandos/security guards or policing at the bus stops after dark.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number for maintenance, damaged lights, etc.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Methodology

- The office of Manager Security and Vigilance of BCLL will be responsible to ensure that women safe design suggested above is reviewed and approved. The approved design is then presented by BMC who is responsible for installation of bus stops
- The approved design should then be piloted at about 10 bus stops around the city.
- Feedback should be collected on the design from the BCLL Women’s Safety Committee and surveys at the bus stops and design should be reviewed based on the feedback.

Figure 43 Redesigning Priority Stretches

Insufficient and obstructed footpaths came up as one of the major concerns with women travellers in the journey to and from a public transport stop. Rapid assessment of the infrastructure along the selected
pilot corridors revealed that while footpaths were available along the regular bus routes, quality of the footpaths were not rated too high by the women commuters. There were no footpaths along Mini bus and Tata Magic routes studied and this has been the pointed out by Tata Magic Users especially as one of the biggest problems in their travel experience (Commuter Surveys). Lack or insufficiency of street lighting was the other most prominent problem noted by women commuters along all public transport routes in the city (Figure 42).

Using Safetipin app the stretches on the pilot routes which scored the least on safety have been identified. These stretches as listed in Table 4 should be redesigned by BMC to ensure Safety of women.

Guidelines

- Strict enforcement of IRC guidelines for footpaths and BIS standards for street lights should be made mandatory.
- Constant review of the footpaths and streetlights to ensure that the required standards is maintained The Engineering Cell of BMC should take the responsibility for the same.
- Information on the responsible authority / who should be contacted to report problems should be provided at public spaces to ensure accountability.

7.2. PHASE 2 SOLUTIONS

7.2.1. Women Safety Committee

Type of Solution – Institutional Capacity

![Figure 44 Women’s Safety Committee](image)

Issues faced by women commuters in using public transport are generally not considered in mainstream public transport planning and operations. Involving women users in planning and policy have been proven to help solve this issue.
BCLL should create a BCLL Women’s Safety Committee which will have representatives from women commuters, women officers from BCLL, bus personnel and representatives from various NGOs working on the issue of women’s safety. The committee will meet on a regular basis and discuss the actions that can be taken to improve the safety of women using bus transport in BCLL. Representation from various stakeholders will ensure that a diverse set of opinions are considered. The Committee will be chaired by the Manager of Safety and Vigilance, BCLL (Figure 43).

This committee will be responsible to review and make suggestions on policies and interventions which will help improve comfort and safety of women passengers in bus transport. The issues that are considered by the committee can be as diverse as design of bus stops to provision of special bus passes, which cater to women passengers. The suggestions that are made by the committee will be presented to the Manger of Safety and Vigilance, who will then duly consider the recommendations and implement it in a phased manner. The committee will meet once every month to ensure continuous evaluation of BCLL’s work.

The Committee will also be responsible to annually select the most women friendly bus transport facilities in the city and award it a “women-friendly facility mark”. This will be highlighted in the annual women’s safety campaign run by the Manager Security and Vigilance’s office.
7.2.2. Safe City Standing Committee

Type of Solution – Institutional Capacity

There are multiple types of public transport in Bhopal as has been discussed in detail above. There are hence a multitude of government and private agencies which work on transport in the city. Sometimes, it is the lack of efficient coordination between multiple agencies which creates unsafe environment for women commuters.

For example: While it is the responsibility of BCLL to ensure safety of its women passengers, the enforcement and grievance system in the city is primarily the responsibility of police. Hence there are multiple initiatives where the combined efforts of both these stakeholder are required for a program/policy to be implemented.

To ensure the coordination between multiple agencies, a Safe City Standing Committee should be formed in Bhopal (Figure 44).

The Safe City Standing Committee which will be chaired either by the Collector of Bhopal/Commissioner of BMC and will have representation for all agencies working on Transport and women’s safety. This will include BCLL, BMC, Police, RTO, Transport Department, Private Operators Unions (for buses, Tata Magics, Mini buses), Women and Child Development Department, women’s groups, public transport user groups.

Figure 45 Safe City Standing Committee
7.2.3. **Women Employees**

Type of Solution – Service Planning & Operations

The number of women employees should be increased so as to have better participation of women in the planning and management process of the public transport of the city (Figure 45). This would help in developing a better understanding of the issues and concerns of women commuters.

Employing more women staff in on ground operations will also help women commuters in feeling more confident while using public transport facilities. However, to ensure the safety of the women employees themselves, it is necessary that this is taken up only after the appointment of Manager Safety and Security. This manager would ensure the establishment of protocols and policies which will create a safe working environment for women employees.
7.2.4. **Special Bus Passes for Women**

**Type of Solution – Service Planning & Operations**

*Figure 47 Special Bus Passes for Women*

The surveys conducted have revealed that women, on an average, spend lesser than men in the household on transport. This could explain why a large number of women opt for informal modes of public transport even though no measures on women’s safety are being followed by these modes. If we are to ensure that more women travel by formal modes of public transport, the rates have to be comparable.

Women also tend to travel more frequently than men during off peak hours given that work trips do not account for most of their trips.

**Guidelines**

BCLL should provide two special passes for women commuters which give them subsidised rate of travel (Figure 46).

- Type 1 pass - Discounted Pass for women travellers which is valid throughout the day
- Type 2 pass - Discounted Pass for women travellers which is valid only during off peak hours. The discount on Type 2 pass should be higher than Type 1 pass.
7.2.5. More Nirbhaya Vans

Type of Solution – Enforcement/ Grievance System

Women Commuters mentioned the lack of appropriate Grievance mechanisms to handle the issues faced by them while using public transport. Driver and Conductor Interviews also helped in highlighting that one of the reasons why cases of harassment against women don’t get reported are because the protocols to be followed are cumbersome. This includes the protocol of the bus being taken to the nearest Police station. Such a measure leads to the rest of the bus commuters complaining leading to such measures being very difficult to enforce.

In order to ensure that women feel safe enough to report harassment and bus personnel feel comfortable enough to handle this issue, it is highly necessary for the Police to showcase that women harassment is a priority issue for them. For this one measure would be mobile police units which would come towards the bus rather than having the bus being taken to the Police station. Bhopal police has already provided for 24 hour mobile police squads, named Nirbhaya Vans in the city. These are designated to handle cases on women’s harassment around the city.

The fleet size of these mobile units should be increased in the city. Nirbhaya Vans should be able to reach the point of complaint anywhere in the city within ten minutes of the complaint being lodged by a woman. Ensuring the availability of mobile units which cater specifically to women’s issues and facilitating immediate action, will help send the message to people in the city that women’s safety is a priority. This will also help women in gaining confidence and higher reporting of cases of harassment (Figure 47).

Panic button should be installed in all modes of public transport linking it to Nirbhaya Vans. Drivers, conductors and passengers should be well aware of the functioning and usage of these panic buttons.
7.2.6. **Protocols for Fitness Certificate**

Type of Solution – Service Planning & Operations

![Figure 49 Protocols for Fitness Certificate](image)

The informal modes of transport in Bhopal have not been able to provide even the basic facilities such as stops, reserved seats and information inside vehicles to ensure women’s safety.

**Guidelines**

For informal modes of public transport like tata magics, mini buses, auto rickshaws and cabs, the RTO will be the responsible agency for ensuring implementation of the protocols/guidelines defined. The annual fitness test certificate should be issued by the RTO only if the following points/conditions are fulfilled (Figure 48):

- All bus personnel involved in operations should be registered under the common database maintained by the Police
- All the Personnel hired have undergone annual training with the Police for gender sensitivity and women’s safety.
- Information on routes, emergency numbers should be compulsorily provided
- Information on the driver including name, address and license number should also be prominently displayed in the vehicle such that passengers can see it easily
7.2.7. Police Women’s Help Line

Type of Solution – Enforcement/ Grievance System

The current Police Women's Helpline should be revamped to ensure that priority calls are immediately transferred to Nirbhaya Police units in the city. In case, a problem of harassment is registered anywhere in the city, the person should contact the Police Women’s Helpline, which will then immediately transfer the details to the nearest Nirbhaya police unit.

This helpline should be made popular across the city and with Public transport personnel. If a case of harassment occurs on a public transport vehicle, the conductor/ Personnel should be instructed to call the mobile unit. The vehicle is then taken to the closest bus stop, where the culprit is handed over to the police mobile unit, who reaches the spot and the next course of action is taken from there. This helpline will be common for all modes of transport in the city like Tata Magics, Regular buses, Mini buses, Auto rickshaws, cabs, etc.

The Police should ensure that the helpline number is made popular. Details will have to be mandatorily provided at all bus stops, public transport vehicles and other public spaces in the city like commercial areas. BCLL’s annual campaign on Women’s safety will also help in popularising the helpline (Figure 49).
7.3. PHASE 3 SOLUTIONS

7.3.1. Protocols for Bus Contract Specifications

Type of Solution – Service Planning & Operations

Though all red buses are provided with 2 CCTVs, less than 75% of them were operational when surveyed (Rapid Assessment). There have been instances of people and many a times drivers and conductors themselves involved in tampering and damaging the CCTVs. On the other hand, Mini buses and Tata Magics are not provided with CCTVs hence there is no surveillance mechanism present in these vehicles. In a significant number of buses, the emergency numbers were either not displayed or tampered with and hence were of no use to women commuters. Tata Magics and Mini buses do not provide such information in their vehicles. Lack of information on routes and emergency numbers have been reported by women commuters as one of their biggest issues on buses (commuter survey).

The Private bus operators’ contract with BCLL gives the following conditions:

- “Operator shall not tamper or interfere with any equipment, instrument or system including the GPS tracking facilities and CCTV surveillance and any other IT and Bus monitoring devices provided in the Buses and the Facilities to enable provision of safer Bus Services to the Passengers”

- “The Operator shall ensure that the information (such as transit route maps, timings, timetables) regarding the Routes and frequency of Buses on particular Routes (including any changes) is made available to the public in a reasonably accessible manner.”

Recommendation

In the contract between BCLL and the private operators, the following point should be included:

- BCLL should ensure that the operator, including his staff, does not tamper with any equipment, instrument or systems including CCTV surveillance and static information. If found guilty strict actions should be taken against the person involved in tampering or interfering with CCTV.
• Evaluation of the functionality of the CCTVs can also be done through integration with MIS and monitoring the same from the centralized control room.

• The design of route information and other details should be finalised and designed by BCLL. These need to be shared with the private operators so that all buses irrespective of operators provide uniform designs and information.

• Non-compliance on the conditions will lead to the private bus operator being fined by BCLL.

• Private operator is required to register the bus personnel details employed under them at the common database maintained by the Police (Refer to section 7.3.5).

• Private operators should also ensure the trainings of both Mid-level managerial staff ground personnel on a yearly basis on gender sensitivity and women’s safety (Refer to section 7.1.3).

Manager safety and vigilance would be responsible to ensure that the protocols related to women’s safety are included into the contractual agreement and conduct regular checks to ensure that the protocols are being followed by the private bus operators (Figure 50).

7.3.2.  Protocols for Licensing

Type of Solution – Service Planning & Operations

One of the problems with the informal modes of public transport is the lack of any government authority to regularly monitor and evaluate the operations. While the RTO is responsible for issuing licenses and fitness certificates, there lacks any oversight on the day to day operations of these modes of public transport. This is an area of huge concern given that a large number of public transport users are dependent on these modes for their commute.

Guidelines

RTO can when issuing licenses for all new minibus and Tata Magics add the clause that these vehicles will have to run under the authority of BMC/ BCLL. Over time, RTO can add this clause even when the fitness certificates are being issued to the existing fleet of vehicles in the city.

This will ensure that similar protocols on safety and security will be followed by all modes of public transport (Figure 51).
7.3.3. Provision of Bus Shelter

Lack of bus shelter was one of the biggest problems highlighted by women commuters. Survey of the routes showed that more 50% of the designated stops on the TR1 routes did not provide a bus shelter. While lack of shelters is expected among informal modes like Tata Magics and Mini buses, it was surprising to see that the problem was common even among formal modes of public transport. Lack of shelters makes it especially difficult for women passengers since they travel more frequently with packages or along with dependents than men. Lack of bus stops also makes women avoid using public transport services since it is not able to provide safety and comfort.

There are no regulations in place currently, which makes it mandatory for BCLL/ BMC to provide shelters at all bus stops. BCLL only makes a request for a bus shelter to BMC for those stops which are used by a significant number of users.

Guidelines
- It should be mandatory for BCLL to provide bus shelters at all bus stops (Figure 52).
- The Vigilance and Women Safety office of BCLL should do an audit of all bus stops in the city and identify stops where shelters have not been provided. This list will then be submitted by BCLL to BMC, who will then make the required shelters.
7.3.4. Protocols for Bus Stop Placement

Type of Solution – Infrastructure & Vehicles

**Figure 54** Protocols for Bus Stop Placement

No other public transport system in the city except for regular buses has formal stops in the city. Mini buses and Tata Magic operate on an informal basis, hence do not have any designated stops and operate mostly out of stops provided for regular buses.

Certain bus stops in the city have been placed in isolated localities. The absence of people around due to land use patterns makes it unsafe for women especially since there is no natural surveillance available. Safetipin audits of bus stops and routes shows that on an average women rate bus stops only slightly lower than men from an overall safety perspective but the rating by women is way lower than men when the bus stops being rated are ones in more isolated localities. This is an indication how women’s perspective of safety is highly correlated to land use and presence of people.

Currently, there are no fixed guidelines currently being followed on making decisions on location of bus stops in the city. BCLL makes recommendations to BMC on location of bus stops based on passenger demand/traffic. BMC then provides bus stops at the location mentioned by BCLL. In cases where there is no land available to make the bus stop at the location recommended, BMC decides on a different point for the bus stop. There are no guidelines followed to determine whether the location of the bus stop is at a location where it is safe for passengers especially for women commuters (Figure 53).

**Guidelines**

- Risk Assessment of a location should be conducted before the location on any bus stop in the city is determined. The Risk Assessment should be conducted by the office of Manager Vigilance and Women’s Safety of BCLL.
- If after the Risk Assessment, the location recommended by BCLL is not determined to be ideal from safety point of view, an alternative location should be recommended, which is close enough (within 300 m) to the initial point suggested by BCLL.
- Location of bus stop should never be at an isolated/lonely place. Bus stop should be ideally located at a point where natural surveillance is possible through shops and other mixed land uses. In cases where it is not possible to provide natural surveillance for bus stops, it is necessary to provide retail/vendor space near the bus stops to ensure safety of passengers.
ensure surveillance after dark, BMC can consider providing a vendor space near a bus stop for free on the condition that the vendor will be available at the location from 9 pm – 5 am in the morning.

7.3.5. Common Data Base

Type of Solution – Enforcement/ Grievance System

A common data base on public transport personnel hired across different modes of public transport need to be created for the city (Figure 55). This will include even details of cab drivers in the city. This database can be maintained by the Police. All public transport operators in the city should contribute details of their staff for the database. This data base will also contain information on whether a sexual harassment case is filed against any of the employees and if this case has been proven. Any person with a record on sexual harassment will be blacklisted and all public transport operators should be forbidden from hiring such a person for operations.
8. END LINE

Two of the key initiatives that were identified for Phase 1 of the gender program has already been undertaken as a part of the project. These were: Gender Sensitisation Training of Drivers and Conductors and Advocacy campaign on women’s safety. The details of both the exercises and their impacts are given below.

**Drivers and Conductors Training**

Trainings and sensitization of bus drivers and conductors on gender and women’s safety were undertaken. The main aim of the training was to help them understand and identify various types of harassment, increase awareness about existing laws with regard to women’s rights, improve the interaction with women passengers and increasing their personal commitment to prevent harassment of passengers especially women. The trainings also focussed on the appropriate steps that can be taken by the ground personnel in case an incident happens on a bus.

A before and after analysis of the trainings were undertaken to understand the changes and impacts of the training sessions on the drivers and conductors. This was focused on understanding the changes both in their perceptions as well as in their knowledge of protocols related to women safety concerns.

After the training sessions almost all the drivers and conductors agreed on strictly abiding the reserved seats criteria. The training also helped them in overcoming their fears of approaching police for help and in intervening and stopping any kind of misbehaviour within the vehicles.

The perception and knowledge of drivers and conductors before and after the training sessions have been described in the Error! Reference source not found. below.

**Table 8 Before and After Analysis of Training**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Questions</th>
<th>Before training</th>
<th>After training</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Do you think the short dresses wore by women is the primary reason behind eve – teasing</td>
<td>80% 20%</td>
<td>15% 85%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Is only Police obliged for women safety</td>
<td>50% 50%</td>
<td>20% 80%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ensuring women safety and maintain her dignity should be the duty of every man</td>
<td>85% 15%</td>
<td>100% 00%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Our duty is to maintain the time table of buses not to protect the passengers</td>
<td>65% 35%</td>
<td>00% 100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The driver or conductor is not responsible for any mishap in their transport</td>
<td>60% 40%</td>
<td>00% 100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Women should not travel alone at night for their own safety</td>
<td>75% 25%</td>
<td>10% 90%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>One big reason behind eve – teasing is weakness of women</td>
<td>35% 65%</td>
<td>05% 95%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Police always harass bus conductor and driver for any incident in their transport</td>
<td>90% 10%</td>
<td>20% 80%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I know my duty in any case of eve-teasing and harassment</td>
<td>30% 70%</td>
<td>90% 10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Outcome</strong></td>
<td>20% 80%</td>
<td>100% 00%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The drivers and conductors committed towards ensuring safer travel for women passengers in their vehicles. The following points were put forward by them for the same:

- Seats allotted to women will be kept reserved
- Men will not be allowed to stand near the reserved seats
- Conductors will not be allowed to incline on reserved seats while collecting fare.
- Drivers and Conductors will intervene and stop any kind of misbehaviour towards women passengers.
- Drivers and Conductors will ensure that emergency information as well as key information on women rights within their vehicles and that they would ensure the information is clearly displayed and not tampered with.
- Drivers and Conductors will not hesitate in calling police in calling the police if necessary.

BCLL should ensure that the training is undertaken on a yearly basis along with the support from Police and a civil society partner. Trainings are only successful in creating behavioural impact on a long term basis only if it is undertaken on a regular basis.

**Advocacy Campaign**

A one week campaign for improving women’s safety and to create awareness on sexual harassment and violence against women in public transport was undertaken. Various activities such as exhibitions at bus stops, signature campaigns, talk shows with police and role plays in the buses were undertaken. People’s feedback on the same was recorded to act as a source of underlying information for later stages.

The campaign was launched by a press conference. Around 40 media persons from both print and electronic media attended the press conference and the campaign received extensive coverage in both local and national newspapers; having an average circulation of more than 2.4 lakhs, news channels as well as in radio stations with local and national reach including All India Radio, Vividh Bharti and Big FM.

The campaign had a mass reach out among citizens and passengers of the city. Exhibitions and signature campaigns were organised at 26 bus stops which have maximum women passenger volumes and plays were organised within moving public transport vehicles.

The Campaign had the following impacts results:

- Around 10,000 students who participated in the discussions pledged that they would raise their voices and concerns towards women safety. All the students after the discussions felt more confident in approaching police in case of any mishap happening in front of them within public transport vehicles.

- More than 200 people took oath at Raahgiri and pledged towards breaking their silence on women safety issues and concerns.

- Around 20, 000 passengers participated in discussions to break silence against any crime against women and girls. People who came forward to sign and pledge were given badges with campaign message, as a gesture of motivation.

- During the Police Talk show more than 200 people voiced their concerns in front of police representatives. As a result of which Police agreed to conduct gender sensitization workshops and trainings on a larger scale.

- Apart from this, announcements by traffic Police personnel were also made at the busiest junctions and squares of the city which helped in spreading the message to large number of people of the city.
As a result of the impact of the campaign, the Police along with BCLL and BMC agreed on conducting a women safety awareness campaign on regular basis.

The advocacy campaign on women’s safety should also be undertaken on a yearly basis to ensure continued impact.

The project activities have got certain activities in Phase 1 started. The rest of the measures will have to be undertaken by BCLL, BMC, Police and RTO over the next one year.

**Table 9 Phase 1 Status**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Phase 1 Status</th>
<th>Gender Sensitivity Training</th>
<th>Women Safety Campaign</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Completed</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not Completed</td>
<td>Manager- Women’s safety</td>
<td>Stop on Request Program</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Redesigning Priority Bus stops</td>
<td>Redesigning priority stretches</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Phase 2 and 3 are to be undertaken in year 2 and 3 respectively after phase 1 projects have been implemented.
9. CONCLUSION

Data from Bhopal has shown that there are distinct differences in the travel patterns of women and men in the city as has been mentioned in literature from around the world. This data helped in highlighting that women spend less than men on travel, are more concerned about safety when choosing their mode of transport, tend to travel less for work, more often with dependents and engage in trip chaining. These differences have not been studied till date in Bhopal. Understanding that there are differences has helped identify solutions which will improve women’s travel experience through increase in comfort and safety.

Data also helped understand the distinct problems that are faced by women commuters during different legs of the journey. It highlighted the fact that there are a whole range of issues which together contribute to women feeling unsafe and restricting their freedom of movement. Hence to address the issue, the solutions also need to be holistic. There is no single solution to solving the problem. To effectively solve the problem, solutions have to address Public transport planning and operations, Institutional capacity, Public transport infrastructure and vehicles and also the Enforcement and Grievance system. It was also understood that multitude of government agencies, which includes, public transport agency, operators, municipal corporation, police, road Transport authority need to work together to address the issue.

There are good practices from around the world which have been proven to be useful. This project has identified the best practices that can be followed in Bhopal which helps in addressing the issues that have been highlighted. This is the first project to holistically look at women’s safety in public transport in India and can if implemented ensure better Safety and Security for women commuters while using Public Transport in the city.
Bibliography


Gauthier, A. & Kunieda, M. "Gender and Urban Transport: Smart and Affordable: Module 7a." GTZ (Division 44) - Sector Project Transport Policy Advisory Service, 2007.


Mulukutla, P & Vasudevan, P. "Expanding the Public Transport Network through a Feeder Bus System – Challenges and Need." Mumbai: EMBARQ India. 2013


One World Foundation India. “Safe Delhi Campaign.” New Delhi, 2011.


Annexure
# ANNEXURE 1 – VALIDATION WORKSHOP DETAILS

Validation Workshop on Recommendations from Pilot Initiative on Women’s Safety in Public Transport

*24th April, 2015*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Speaker</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>11:30 – 11:45</td>
<td>Inaugural Address</td>
<td>Chandramauli Shukla, CEO BCLL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Opening Remarks</td>
<td>Amit Bhatt, EMBARQ India</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11:45 – 11:55</td>
<td>Introduction to Safe Cities Initiative</td>
<td>Manisha Telang, DFID</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11:55 - 12:30</td>
<td>Women Safety in Public Transport: Introductory Session and Project Findings</td>
<td>Amit Bhatt, EMBARQ India</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12:30 - 01:15</td>
<td>Presentation on Recommendation on:</td>
<td>Ranjana Menon, EMBARQ India</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1. Institutional Capacity</td>
<td>Azra Khan, EMBARQ India</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. Enforcement and Grievance</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3. Service Planning &amp; Operations</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4. Infrastructure &amp; Vehicles</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>01:15 - 01:45</td>
<td>Question &amp; Answers</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>01:45 – 02:00</td>
<td>Valedictory</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>02:00 – 02:45</td>
<td>Lunch</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Minutes of Meeting

- Panic Button or a similar such mechanism to be installed in public transport vehicles so that Nirbhaya Vans/ police help can immediately reach the point where the PT vehicle is, thereby removing the whole procedure of taking the vehicle to the police station. This would speed up the reaction process by police and culprits can be handed over to the police immediately. Drivers and conductors should be trained specifically to use this mechanism. This point was made by the DIG, Police while discussing about the recommendation made by EMBARQ India on increasing the number of Nirbhaya Vans and their promptness to reach the point of crime.

- In response to the recommendation on provision of special help lines by Police and BCLL, the DIG, Police also said that a service called ‘Dial 100’ will soon be started in the city. This service will start within a year by Police and would be a common and universal complaint number for all. He also said there is a women’s complaint number – ‘1091’ but the awareness among citizens and especially drivers and conductors about this is very low. Hence each and every PT mode should display this number properly and people would be made aware of it, which is also covered in one of the recommendations made by EMBARQ India about the display and awareness on emergency numbers.

- In response to the recommendation that Police should house drivers and conductors trainings, DIG, Police said that they are ready to conduct the trainings for drivers and conductors as recommended.

In response to the recommendation with regard to protocols for bus operations, absence of security mechanisms like GPS devices in informal modes and common database of all public transport personnel has already been made under recommendations by EMBARQ India. The following points were proposed:

- Chandra Mauli Shukla, CEO, BCLL proposed to bring all modes of public transport under BCLL’s jurisdiction, so as to have better control over their functioning. BCLL would then install GPS in all PT modes so as to have better monitoring and safety. PT coverage can also be improved by this and BCLL would be in a condition to provide better infrastructure facilities across all PT modes. In response to this DIG, Police proposed that initially all modes can be brought under the jurisdiction of BMC and later can be moved on under BCLL.

- Chandra Mauli Shukla, CEO, BCLL also said that once brought under government jurisdiction, route rationalization for all modes can be worked out by so as to improve frequency and provide better services across the city.

- Tejaswi Naik, Commissioner, BMC said that a mobile application can be developed giving information of the PT modes availability at any given time and point of the city.

- The DIG, Police in response to above points stated that colour coding of vehicles can be done as per the routes on which they operate to improve effectiveness in operations and ease of passengers.

- The DIG, Police also proposed in continuation to the above point that RTO can make certain parameters mandatory for issuing permits and fitness certificates to vehicles. These can include:
  - The vehicle is operating under BCLL’s jurisdiction/ is registered with BCLL
  - The vehicle should have a GPS device installed
  - The driver conductor should be registered under common database with BCLL

- Discussing about the recommendations on improving the institutional capacity, Tejaswi Naik, Commissioner, BMC said that all the government agencies will have to work together helping in convergence of resources for better safety in PT modes in the city. He also said that supporting agencies to BCLL, women’s at BCLL etc can work as THINK TANKS in the process.
• Tejaswi Naik, Commissioner, BMC, also said that the government agencies are looking forward to improve the public transport services in the city. He also mentioned that Bhopal is the only city having a 'Mayor in Council' member specifically to look into transport of the city which in itself is a pioneering step forward.

• Alok Sharma, Mayor, Bhopal said that separate budget worth 3 crores for NMT and 10 crores to improve formal modes of PT transport have been allocated and that the same would be utilised to look into the recommendations proposed.

• He also advised all the government officials and ward councillors to personally go on visits and checks in public transport modes and during their visits should specifically interact with women commuters so as to take feedback and to have better understanding of the problems faced by them. This was mentioned in the recommendation about developing feedback mechanisms for all the services provided.

• Prarthana Mishra, Secretary, Sangini gender Resources Centre proposed that school buses and vans should also be included in these recommendations and that safety should be guaranteed in these modes as well.

• Asmita Basu, DFID, proposed that BCLL can look into including safety concerns and mechanisms through certain norms and conditions in contractual agreements with private operators. The point has been captured in one of the recommendations related to protocols of bus operations.
List of Participants

1. Alok Sharma: Mayor, Bhopal
2. Kewal Mishra : MIC Member, Transport
3. Tejaswi Naik : Commissioner BMC
4. D. Srinivas Verma: DIG, Bhopal Police
5. Mahendra Jain, DSP, Traffic Police, Bhopal
6. Chandra Mauli Shukla, CEO, BCCL
7. Shafeeq Ahmed, Jr. Manager, UADD (on behalf of Kamal Nagar, OSD Transport, UADD)
8. O.V Suhag, CEO Capital Roadways
9. R.S Kushwaha, Prasanna Purple
10. Ganesh Singh Baghel, President, Minibus Association Bhopal
11. Prarthana Mishra, Secretary, Sangini Gender Resource Centre, Bhopal
12. Richard Slater, Team Lead, MPUIIP
13. Mr C.U.Roy - Deputy Director (MPUIIP )
14. Shahzad Khan, Livelihood Expert, MPUIIP
15. Rakesh Shandilya, Community Development Officers (CDO) in BMC under MPUIIP
16. Rani Tiwari, Community Development Officers (CDO) in BMC under MPUIIP
17. Ashish Mishra, Senior Community Mobilisation Expert MPUIIP Bhopal
18. Chaya Khale , Community Mobilisation Expert MPUIIP Bhopal
19. Arti Parashar Community Mobilisation Expert MPUIIP Bhopal
20. Prakash Arya, PPP Expert, MPUIIP
21. Manisha Telang, DFID
22. Asmita Basu, DFID
23. Amit Bhatt, Strategy Head, EMBARQ India
24. Ranjana Menon, Associate, EMBARQ India
25. Azra Khan, Consultant, EMBARQ India

Participants from Print Media:

- Dainik Bhaskar
- Sandhya Prakash
- Nav Duniya
- People’s Samachar
- Patrika

Participants from Electronic Media:

- India TV
- BTV
- Doordarshan
- Sahara Samay
- DDN
Media Coverage - Validation Workshop

Print Media Coverage

Dainik Bhaskar:

प्रयोगः दोन कल्पित ट्रांसपोर्ट पर अधिशासन में सुखाला, ठंडवर भी करते हैं महिलाओं के लिए अद्यतन पब्लिक ट्रांसपोर्ट में 88% महिलाओं से छूटछट

पत्रिका: 4/5/2016

परिशिष्ट ट्रांसपोर्ट: स्वीकार, मैनिफेस्ट पर होना अब जीवित है जो कि ट्रांसपोर्ट के पास कारवाएँ करते हैं शहर के हर कोने से मिलेगी सुविधा
मैजिक, आपे और मिनी बर्से चलाएगा बीसीएलएल..!

विशेष सेल बनाने की मांग

प्रारंभिक शिक्षा अनुमोदन भारत सरकार के लाइक उपकरण सेल की और आईपीएसएस विभाग के इस कारण दो भी एकत्रित किया गया जिसे फॉर्मेल क-एलएल नामक नया उत्पाद लॉन्च कराने का निश्चय किया।

आदेश सीडी जी सिविलियन वर्मा, नर्मन निगम आदेश तैयारी नारायण, वॉलीबॉल टूर्नामेंट में मुख्य कार्यालय आईपीएसएस चंडीगढ़ में सुरक्षा पर अधिकारी चंडीगढ़ के प्रमुख शिक्षक अध्यापक किताब सतिर एक वहां लगभग नवीन विकास विभागीय पहले अधिकारी रहे।

निकल, डीआईजी आईन्स्टीटुट ऑफ मोडलिंग और वॉलीबॉल टूर्नामेंट के लिए एक सेल का आयोजन किया गया।

भोजन।

आदेश सीडी जी सिविलियन वर्मा, नर्मन निगम आदेश तैयारी नारायण, वॉलीबॉल टूर्नामेंट में मुख्य कार्यालय आईपीएसएस चंडीगढ़ में सुरक्षा पर अधिकारी चंडीगढ़ के प्रमुख शिक्षक अध्यापक किताब सतिर एक वहां लगभग नवीन विकास विभागीय पहले अधिकारी रहे।

फोटो मनीकर सिंह

Pradesh Today:
Transport services unfit for women passengers in city

Staff Reporter

A TOTAL of 88 per cent women in State capital have faced harassment while using public transport services, while 40 per cent of women passengers face harassment on a daily basis in the public transport systems of city. These bewildering facts were presented by EMBARQ India after completion of a survey for pilot initiative for Women Safety in Public Transport in Bhopal. The facts raised questions on part of administration and the Bhopal Municipal Corporation which has been regularly claiming to provide safe ride to women passengers in state capital.

The reason behind the increase in the rates of women harassment can be accounted from the fact that 30 per cent of drivers and conductor believe that women are equally responsible for harassment, while 100 per cent of them think that harassment is not a prevalent issue in Bhopal. The survey was conducted by EMBARQ India in four legs. The first leg consisted of journey from original source to bus stop followed by second leg which is waiting at the bus stop, third leg involves boarding and riding in the bus and the final leg indicates the problems faced by women on the bus generally due to poor attitude and behaviour of conductors and other male passengers.

A total of 20 bus stops in city have been identified as unsafe for women passengers in state capital. The survey was conducted on women passengers at various bus stops of city, to end up with the fact that bus stops at Prakash Tarun Pushkar, Akriti Ecocity, Tilak Nagar, Kamla Park, Ravindra Bhavan, Charkhi, Bittan market, Ishwar Nagar, VIP Guest house, Polytechnic, Pump House, Bairagarh, Kasturba Hospital, Career College, Govindpura Thana New Court, Arera Hills, Vallabhavan, Vindhyachal, Nanke petrol pump, Taj Mahal, VIP Guest House, Pump House, Bairagarh are unsafe for women passengers.

The survey has taken the officials of Bhopal Municipal Corporation and Traffic Police on guard. DIG Shreenivasa Varma after watching the presentation gave the suggestion for installation of panic button system in the public transport systems, so that the Nirbhaya team can be deployed immediately once it is pressed. Officials have indicated for formation of a committee with the members of BCLL, Bhopal Police and Regional Transport Office to enhance the rules and safety of women passengers of state capital.

Bhopal City Link Limited is now going to form a report of all the suggestions received in the workshop in order to develop new mechanism to ensure safety and security of women passengers in public transport modes of city.
भोपाल, 24 अप्रैल. नगर पालिका निगम भोपाल, भोपाल सिटी लिंक लिमिटेड एवं एनबीई एंड एचडीए द्वारा संयुक्त रूप से Recommendation from pilot initiative for Women's Safety in Public Transport in Bhopal विषय पर कार्यशाला महापौर आलोक शर्मा की अध्यक्षता में आईएसबीटी स्थित परिसर सभाक्ष्रम कार्यालय में शुक्रवार को सम्पन्न हुई।

कार्यशाला का उद्देश्य लोक परिवहन सेवा के अंतर्गत संचालित वाहनों में महिलाओं की सुरक्षा प्रदान करना, महिलाओं के साथ होने वाली छेड़छाड़ को रोकना, महिलाओं को आत्मनिर्भर बनाना एवं महिलाओं को सुरक्षित माहील प्रदान करते हुए सुविधाजनक एवं भयंकर लोक परिवहन की सेवा उपलब्ध कराना था. कार्यशाला में डा. आईयू और डा. श्रीनिवास चर्म, निगम आयुक्त तेजस्वी एस. नायक, महापौर परिषद के सदस्य मेजर मिश्र निगम बीसीएलएल, टॉप मार्क पुलिस व एनबीई एंड एचडीए के अधिकारी मौजूद थे. कार्यशाला में महापौर आलोक शर्मा ने लोक परिवहन के साथ में महिलाओं को सुरक्षित माहील प्रदान करने का समर्थन किया है नगर पालिका निगम तथा शासन की ओर से हर समय सहयोग प्रदान करने हेतु आवश्यक किया.
बसों और बीआरटीएस में कैमरे लगाकर रोकी जाएगी छड़छाड़

जागरण प्रतिवादी, भोपाल। भोपाल महापरिषद अलौकिक महाबीज के इस शासन का पत्रकार भी सुझाव दे रहा है कि पश्चिम दूरबील में महाबीजों के साथ छड़छाड़ की बात नहीं होनी चाहिए।

इस तरह की घटनायामों को प्रतिबंधित के लिए बसों के साथ-साथ पूरी बीआरटीएस कार्यालय में भी बीमारी लगाए जाएगी।

इसके अलावा, पश्चिम दूरबील में जीपीआरटीएस रिस्टर्म लगाए जाएंगे। इससे हर पेश छुट्टियों और निगम के कारनामों नहर यहीं नहीं होंगे। यहां सभी पश्चिम दूरबील में केंद्रदर, हवाई, बस कार, आंदोलन और मुख्य चालक वगैरह के साथ ही समोर मौजूद अविनाशी रूप से लगाए।

यह भी जाना जरूरी है कि फिर झड़छाड़ रोकने के लिए सरकारी महापरिषद ऑफिस में कार्यालय के साथ-साथ भोपाल में भी लगाए जाएं। यह कार्यालय सभी समस्याओं के लिए एक दिवसीय कार्यालय में भोपाल अग्रणी गणरा ने कहा। उन्हीं के अध्यायों को लेकर नयी नियोक्ताओं का समावेश करने का प्रयास किया जा रहा है।

शहर का पश्चिम दूरबील हो निगम के हवाले

अभी तक नहीं है कि इस प्रस्ताव को निगम ने अपने हाथों पर लिया अथवा नहीं।

*शहर का पश्चिम दूरबील हो निगम के हवाले*

*बसों और कंटेंटर लगाकर रोकी जाएगी जीपीआरटीएस रिस्टर्म*

हां, दूरबील दूरबील में जीपीआरटीएस रिस्टर्म के लिए आलोचनात्मक उत्साह है। महाराज दुर्गा दया देवी ने जाना कि फिर झड़छाड़ रोकने के लिए अलग राजनीति चाहिए। यह सही है कि फिर झड़छाड़ रोकने के लिए अलग राजनीति चाहिए। इसके अलावा, भोपाल में रोड राउंड होने चाहिए।

पूरे शहर का गृह्य और इंसानों के लिए आलोचनात्मक उत्साह है। इसके अलावा, भोपाल में रोड राउंड होने चाहिए।

फिर झड़छाड़ रोकने के लिए आलोचनात्मक उत्साह है।
The workshop was also covered by the following electronic media groups:

- India TV
- BTV
- Doordarshan
- Sahara Samay
- DDN
ANNEXURE 2 – LITERATURE REVIEW

7 cities within and outside India, which have looked at the gender aspect in public transport or safety of women in public spaces were identified. The steps taken by the cities and the impact of the projects were then analysed to draw lessons for Bhopal.

4 reports on gender and public transport were also reviewed as a part of the literature review. This helped in understanding the essential differences in travel patterns of men and women and thus helped the project team in identifying the relevant data that should be collected for the city and in learning of some best practices.

Case Studies

Bangalore Metropolitan Transport Corporation (BMTC), Bangalore

Introduction

Bangalore is India’s 5th largest city and one of the fastest growing in the world. It covers a total area of over 824 sq kms, with the population of 8.4 million (2012). The Bangalore Metropolitan Transport Corporation (BMTC) came into existence in 1997 with the sole aim of providing public transportation to Bangalore city and sub-urban areas. It serves more than 4.8 million commuters of the city. It has a fleet of more than 6440 buses covering an area encompassed with radius of 40.4 kms from the city centre. In a day, BMTC operates 502 city and 1887 sub-urban routes, running 14.31 lakh kms and making 82,818 trips.

A 2012-13 survey spearheaded by Bangalore Bus Prayana Vedike found that two out of three women travelling in BMTC buses regularly face regular violence and harassment (both verbal and physical), from co-passengers, conductors and drivers.

Currently, BMTC has undertaken multiple initiatives to increase safety and comfort of their women passengers.

Initiatives/ Projects

- **Reserved Seats**: There are reserved seats for women in first half of the buses. BMTC has declared men occupying the seats reserved for women passengers a punishable offence. It has collected a penalty of 11 lakhs from 11,013 men passengers for violating this rule (Indian Express, 2014).

- **Ladies Special Buses**: These are ‘Ladies Special’ Buses operated for the exclusive use by women commuters and children of both sexes below the age of 12 years. The service is aimed at providing travel convenience to working women commuting to and from the place of work. Currently, 22 ladies special trips are operated between different parts of the city and the CBD in the morning and evening hours.

- **Training of Personnel**: sensitization trainings are also given to all BMTC personnel, regarding their behavior towards women and their safety. Regular awareness campaign is being done by deputing teams from BMTC, every month to create awareness among women, about what they should do, in case of any such incident.

- **CCTV Cameras**: 500 buses have been fitted with CCTV cameras so far. BMTC is in the process of installing cameras on all the buses, for which financial support has been sought from Govt. of India, under Nirbhaya fund.

- **Helpline**: BMTC has a helpline number for all commuters. It also has a special provision to take up calls on issues regarding women safety and it would be dealt on top priority. The call centres have been upgraded to reduce call drops and take up emergency calls on priority basis. A person has to dial 2 after landing on the call centre number and that call would be taken on priority, even disconnecting regular customer calls. A complainant is also given a complaint number with the help of which he or she can track the status of the complaint. The call centre will co-ordinate with the Sarathi fleet of BMTC and also the police’s mobile units to ensure help reaches the spot at the earliest.
**Consumer Forum:** Bangalore also has a Bus Consumer’s Forum called Bangalore Bus Prayaanikara Vedike (BBPV). It was originally formed in response to the steep fare hikes by BMTC in June 2013. Since then Vedike has been campaigning for better BMTC services including reduced fares. They have come together with BMTC and Police to work for women’s safety in public transport.

A ‘**Passengers’ Security Committee/ Women’s Safety Committee**’ has also been constituted under Director, Security and Vigilance of BMTC, with women officers from BMTC and Police and representatives from various NGOs and commuter forums like the Bangalore Bus Prayaanikara Vedike and people working on the issue of women’s safety. This meets on regular basis and discusses the actions to be taken to improve the safety conditions.

**Patrolling:** BMTC has introduced a special patrolling vehicle named “Sarathi”. These vehicles ensure proper bus operation on the route, proper stoppage of buses on the bus stops and also ensure occupation of reserved seats by women, elderly and handicapped commuters.

**Coordination with Police:** Provisions have been for women passengers travelling in BMTC buses to hand over sexual offenders to either the Hoysala or Abhaya police. The conductors and drivers are instructed to call the Abhaya police (1091) or the Hoysala police (100) who patrol the city constantly. The bus is then taken to the closest bus stop where the culprit will be handed over to the Abhaya or Hoysala police officers and the next course of action is taken. This initiative has not only ensured that women speak up when faced by sexual abuse but has also ensured that by getting the police involved, prompt action can be taken against the offenders.

**Provisions for Women Employees:** BMTC has also established a Ladies Grievance committee headed by Senior Lady Counsellor as well as lady officers to redress all grievances of female employees of the Corporation.

---

**Safe Delhi Campaign, New Delhi**

**Introduction**

Delhi is a prime example of the modern city that has witnessed rapid urbanization and population expansion in the last few decades. The capital city of India has been notorious for its reputation of being unsafe for women. Of the 25 megacities in India (cities with more than 1 million population), Delhi ranks the highest on instances of violence against women (National Crime Records Bureau, 2009-10). A public perception survey that was carried out for the first Delhi Human Development Report in the year of 2004 with a sample of 13,000 respondents, showed that only 19% of those surveyed felt the city safe.

It is in this context that Jagori, an NGO which works on women issues launched the ‘Safe Delhi’ campaign. “Women have the right to live, to work and to move around with safety and dignity” was the motto of the campaign which was launched in 2004.

“The campaign aimed at guaranteeing an equal opportunity to women to access and use public places as their right without the constant feeling of fear and insecurity. For doing so the campaign advocates gender sensitive urban designing and planning, a responsive police and judiciary, a better public transport system and an increased civic awareness.”

**Initiatives/ Projects**

- Gender safety audits were carried out across the city to identify issues, which make a place safe or unsafe for women and girls. A series of over 40 safety audits were undertaken by JAGORI in commercial, residential, educational areas of Delhi.
- Dialogue with Various Stakeholders like Municipal Corporation of Delhi, Delhi Police, Delhi Transport Corporation, Delhi Metro Rail Corporation etc; partnering with Various Citizen’s Groups like PEHEL and Women’s Development Cell in Delhi University, Gurgaon GirlCott etc. The idea was to increase sensitivity and accountability towards women safety.
- A ‘Public Awareness Campaign’ was also carried out. This included mass and outdoor media campaigns and workshops with college students and faculty members comprising of experience and training in the field of women’s safety.
sharing discussions and short sensitization sessions. Street interventions like ‘Safe Delhi at the Half Marathon’ ‘Take back the night’ and ‘Kya Dekh Rahe Ho’ (to question ‘Staring’, a very common form of street sexual harassment) were the activities that were undertaken as a part of the campaign.

- Vulnerable locations of violence and harassment have been identified and a strategic framework was formulated for Delhi. The same has been shared with all relevant government departments.

The biggest success of the campaign has been in bringing great attention to the issue of women safety. It has not only highlighted the need to address such issues but has also created a mass support base. It has also established the fact that women’s safety is no longer only a women’s issue and diverse groups of people have a role to play in creating safer communities and cities.

**BEST, Mumbai**

**Introduction**

“Today, of the seven million journeys undertaken by the rail system every day, 1.5 to two million journeys access stations through the bus network managed by BEST, entailing a ridership of 5.5 million passengers per day.” (Mulukutla & Vasudevan)

The Brihanmumbai Electricity Supply and Transport (BEST) undertaking is one of the largest bus transit system in India. There are 4700 buses with the BEST undertaking ferrying approximately 5 million passengers over 365 routes. There are three types of buses which fleet to serve the public transportation – AC Buses, Double Decker Buses and the Ordinary Buses.

Mumbai with its explosive population and a strong dependence on its railway network set up the BEST transport service to operate their feeder bus routes. The bus service was created with a vision to enhance the public transportation system and improve accessibility to the suburban railways, so that large movement across the island can take place with an easy flow.

BEST has taken several measures to ensure a safe and secure travelling for the passengers especially for the women.

**Initiatives/ Projects**

- **Reserved seats:** 10% seats reservation for women in Double-decker, 16% in AC Buses and 25% in Ordinary Buses. Steps are also been taken to ensure enforcement of the reservation rules.
- **CCTV Cameras:** In August 2006, BEST introduced CCTV on its buses.
- **Pay phones at bus stops** introduced in August 2006.
- **Women’s helpline:** Recently, with a collaborative effort of Akshara foundation the BEST launched its helpline number 103 for the women who face any sort of eve teasing or misbehaving to ensure instant help to these women.
- **Online Bus tracking system** – The BEST is very much committed to the passengers convenience and understands the value of time and therefore it recently launched the online bus tracking system where the passengers after a simple free registration with their email ID can easily track the current location and timing of the bus and expected arrival time at a particular bus stop so that one need not has to wait for hours for the bus.
- **Proper signage in the bus as well as at the bus stops** – The BEST buses carry important information and numbers/complaint numbers/helpline numbers in the form of signage inside the bus. The bus stops are with shelters and have seating provided. Every bus stop contains the bus stop name and bus route numbers displayed.
- **Training of Bus Personnel** - The drivers and conductors are also gender sensitized and trained through workshops conducted by BEST with help of civil society organizations from time to time.
- **Booklets** - The BEST provides small booklets which are easily available to the public from any BEST bus depot. These booklets clearly describe the importance of women’s safety in the public
transportation and addresses important concerns like sexual harassment, eve teasing in the buses faced by women while travelling.

**Toronto Transit Commission, Toronto**

*Introduction*

This case study demonstrates the collaborative relationship between a community-based women’s organization, Toronto Transit Commission and the Toronto Police Department in making improvements to the public transport system. Further, the safety audit introduced a participatory experiential tool as an alternative source of data on women transit users (Wekerle 2005).

While there were many changes in the activities undertaken by TTC after the mid-1990s, this case study provides an example of improvements initiated in the public transport system in partnership with women’s advocacy organizations.

*Initiatives/ Projects*

- **Safety Audits**- METRAC collaborated with Toronto Transit Commission (TTC) to conduct a comprehensive safety audit of the city’s transit system and define ways it could be made safer for women commuters (Loukaitou-Sideri 2009). Women’s experience of everyday life became the basis for developing the safety audits. They were encouraged to name the places where they felt unsafe in the day and night and to talk about what made them feel uncomfortable. 41% of the women identified elements of the public transport system as unsafe or uncomfortable at night (Wekerle 2005).

- **Survey of women on Public transit experience**- at forums like Stopping Rape (April 16, 1988), METRAC distributed questionnaires asking women to share their experiences of public transit with a focus on sexual harassment and assault. Additionally, TTC organized a discussion session with women’s groups, two-thirds through the audit of the subway system. Representatives of women’s groups narrated experiences of sexual assault and harassment on public transit, to the senior management of TTC. This is considered an important juncture in convincing TTC that the system was not as safe as they believed it to be (Wekerle 2005).

- **63 recommendations were made which included:**
  - Transparent bus shelters for better visibility,
  - Emergency intercoms in transit settings with little or no staff, elevators for safer
  - Well-lit designated waiting areas at subway stations with CCTV cameras and intercoms,
  - Request-stop program on buses between 9pm and 5am for women traveling alone (Loukaitou-Sideri 2009).
  - TTC should involve women and other users in the transport planning and policy process, hire a gender planner to review all plans. (Wekerle 2005).
  - Create a staff position to investigate all incidents of sexual assault and harassment and liaise with advocacy organizations;
  - Emphasize safety features within the transit system in public awareness campaigns and produce a film on women’s safety in public transit
  - More employment of women as front line workers
  - Develop ongoing training programs on how to respond to issues of sexual assault and harassment
  - Creating a standing user’s committee on women’s issues, this consisted of representatives of women’s organizations, in Toronto.

- **TTC accepted the recommendations, set up an internal taskforce with representation from every department to implement them and revised their design standards manual. A Security Advisory Committee was also created to provide advice on the design of stations on the new subway line (Wekerle 2005).**
Nairobi

Introduction

Nairobi is the capital city of Kenya and also serves as the administrative centre and economic hub of the nation. Crime in the city is high and perceived to be increasing annually and the issue of security has become the most identifiable criteria negatively impacting on the quality of life in Nairobi (Kamau, 2002). Escalating crime and insecurity in the city of Nairobi are hindering social and economic development in the city and severely eroding the city's reputation internationally. These are often linked to institutional weaknesses in formal and informal sectors of society, including the police and justice systems.

UN-HABITAT's Safer Cities Programme established Safer Nairobi Initiative in November, 2000. It is led by the City Council of Nairobi, which supports a city-wide, co-ordinated, comprehensive, and community-based approach to crime prevention and urban safety.

The Safer Nairobi Initiative focuses on four crime prevention pillars - better enforcement of laws and by-laws; improvement of urban design and environment; provision of support to groups at risk, including children, youth, women and street families and community empowerment.

Initiatives/ Projects

- **Citywide Crime Victimization Survey**: In the year 2001, the Safer Cities Programme of UN-HABITAT in conjunction with the Intermediate Technology Development Group-Eastern Africa (a regional NGO), conducted a citywide crime victimization survey. The results of the victimization survey indicated that the incidence of violence against women in Nairobi was high and the violations were perceived as a serious problem. Since then, the Government of Kenya, the Safer Cities Programme, the Nairobi City Council, the provincial administration, ITDG-EA and various stakeholders have been formulating and implementing crime prevention strategies for the City of Nairobi.

- **Planning Guidelines**: In 2006, UN-HABITAT, in partnership with the Nairobi City Council, developed detailed planning guidelines for the city of Nairobi from a safety perspective. A Crime Prevention through Environmental Design (CPTED) approach was followed, giving way to a more holistic orientation including the design, planning and management of public spaces.

- **Safety Audit Toolkit**: Safety audit questionnaires and checklists were developed, and safety audit training of technical officers from city councils of Nairobi were conducted. A Safety Assessment Walk was planned to design an elaborate questionnaire for the development of future safety audits and also for the development of a women's safety audit tool kit, implemented citywide. A group of women, including representatives of women's organizations conducted the safety assessment walk, accompanied by some policy makers, representatives of the Nairobi City Council and the Kenya Police, some members of the business community and the Nairobi City Council, and under the technical guidance of UN-HABITAT.

- **Other Activities**: Various other activities undertaken as a part of the project include training seminars for City Council of Nairobi (CCN) chief/technical officers and councillors on crime prevention, and study tours to similar projects in Dar es Salaam and Montreal, constituency consultations, youth employment focused pilot project , stakeholders consultations involving CCN and: Residents Associations (KARA), Business (KAM), Community Policing Groups (NCBDA), Slum Dwellers (Shelter Forum), Police Stations (Kenya Police), Women Groups (CREAW), Youth (Youth for Habitat). Public Rally to raise project profile and engage city residents in CCN's security-focused initiatives/activities were also undertaken.

1 Each group was guided by a map and a number of guiding questions, which they kept in mind as they carried out the exercise. During the walk, the women discussed all aspects relating to the safety and insecurity of the area. Some of the issues were related to lighting, visibility, the environmental surroundings, maintenance etc. the groups then met and held discussions on their experiences and made recommendations for changes in the urban design that will enhance the safety and reduce feelings of insecurity and opportunities for crime.
The Nairobi City Council committed itself to allocate specific, earmarked budgets for enhancing women’s safety, and also develop a ‘one-stop’ model centre for women. It has also brought together integrated police and prosecution services, accessible judicial services, affordable legal and counselling services, doctor and medical services including capacity to preserve evidence, linkages to the court with ability to obtain instantaneous prosecution orders amongst other services, under one roof.

The Safer Nairobi Initiative reports to having “overwhelming” amounts of requests for support from the community. The project also increased interaction with vulnerable groups, youth, and women from informal settlements, increased sensitization, and an enhanced ability to prioritize local projects.

The Safer Nairobi Initiative noted that safety audits raised the profile of safety as an issue to be routinely considered in any major planning process. It also recommends a great deal of follow-up action and specialized human resources on the part of those conducting the audit in order to receive a positive response.

Transport for London, London

Introduction

London has a population of 8.17 million (Census 2011) over 1583 square kilometres (London Councils 2013). Transport for London (TfL) is a single authority operating London’s public transport network and main roads. This includes London’s buses, the Tube network, Docklands Light Railway, Over ground and Tram link. TfL also runs Barclays Cycle Hire, London River Services, Victoria Coach Station, the Emirates Air Line and London Transport Museum (TfL, What we do n.d.).

TfL created a Women’s Action Plan in 2004, which called for a number of actions to provide a transport system shaped by women’s lifestyles. It included discounted fares for part-time employees, since many women tend to be part-time employees, additional research to evaluate the success of providing child-care centres at transit stations, low-floor and step-free buses and upgrading bus stops to ensure that they are compatible with the buses and increase women’s participation in its labour force from 22% to 52%, which was in alignment with London’s population (Transportation Research Board 2010). TfL has taken considerable amount of measures towards women safety and it has been a huge success.

Initiatives/Projects

- In 2007, in response to the Gender Equality Act (2006), which required all public authorities in Great Britain to produce a gender equality scheme; TfL published its Gender Equality Scheme 2007-2010. This process involved extensive consultation with 140 women’s groups in London (Transportation Research Board 2010).
- Five broad areas were prioritized: accessibility (which includes availability, vehicles integration, barriers to travel and infrastructure), safety & security (which includes improving real and perceived levels of security), affordability (which includes costs and fares), information and employment (which include equal pay, recruitment, retention, flexible working and workplace culture).
- The Greater London Authority’s Gender Equality Assessment (Greater London Authority (GLA) 2012) revealed women’s status vis-à-vis men in a number of areas. Specifically in transport, it was observed that women were more likely to walk and use buses, but less likely to cycle or use rail, Underground and cars than men (Transport for London (TfL) 2011).

Women aged 25-44 years were likely to make more trips than their male counterparts (Transport for London (TfL) 2009). Women’s use of public transport was constrained by their concern for safety,

---

2 By 2005, all London buses were low floor and step-free. The new buses had large designated spaces for wheelchairs and strollers as well as designated areas for packages and groceries. TfL also aimed to complete installation of real-time information on buses, bus stops by the end of 2008 (Transportation Research Board 2010).
especially after dark. Around 25% women compared to 17% men felt unsafe travelling by local buses or the tube, alone at night (Greater London Authority (GLA) 2011).

It was observed that even though women felt safer using minicabs at night than other forms of transport (Greater London Authority (GLA) 2009) (Greater London Authority (GLA) 2010) there were a significant number of cab-related sexual offences, mostly perpetrated by illegal mini-cab drivers (Greater London Authority (GLA) 2012).

- The Annual London Surveys conducted from 2005-2011 revealed that there was a decrease in the percentage of women who felt unsafe using public transport alone at night (GLA n.d.). The number of sexual assaults in London’s rail networks had decreased from 55,000 (2005-06) to 41,000 (2010-11). However, those perpetrated against women constituted a majority and had increased from 292 (2005-06) to 392 (2010-11) (British Transport Police 2006) (British Transport Police 2011).
- Concerns were addressed by improving accessibility of transport services³, so that 90 percent of commuters lived within 400 metres of a bus stops and all the public bus fleet were accessible to wheelchair users.
- Public transport was made affordable for certain groups. The Freedom Pass provided free transport to people 60 and over.
- Safety was addressed by publishing “The Right Direction”, which aimed at working with different police authorities to ensure safe travel door-to-door.
- Around 32 new Safer Transport Teams were created in every borough, including additional teams at the main transport hubs across London, doubling the number of cab enforcement officers, establishing cycle task force and providing funding through TfL to provide 900 British Transport Police across London (Greater London Authority (GLA) 2012).
- An annual Safer Travel at Night campaign was launched with TfL, Metropolitan Police Service, Safer Transport Command and the City of London Police to highlight the danger of getting into unbooked minicabs. Further police resources working on this activity were doubled, a dedicated Cab Enforcement Unit established, 1250 arrests made for cab offences (Greater London Authority (GLA) 2012), create a one number taxi booking service and provide local travel information on boards at clubs and pubs (Smith 2008).

TfL’s Women’s Action Plan and Gender Equality Scheme are considered the most comprehensive efforts by transport operators to respond to the needs of women’s riders (Transportation Research Board 2010).

Women Friendly City Project, Seoul

Introduction

Since the Fourth UN World Conference on Women in Beijing (1995), Korea has been making efforts to integrate gender perspectives into policy and programs. It introduced a gender impact assessment in 2004, which was adopted as the Gender Impact Assessment Act in 2011. This applied to all laws and projects undertaken by national and local governments. Existing guidelines were revised to ensure that GIA were undertaken for any new government activity. The results were to be incorporated in the following year’s budgets. The Korean government introduced gender responsive budgeting in 2010, which was expanded to local governments in 2013 (OECD 2014 ).

Within this context, the Seoul Metropolitan Government introduced the Women Friendly City Project in 2007-2010 with the objective of making the city a place where women could be happy and comfortable (Seoul Metropolitan Government 2009). It was based on the premise that city-level policies considered a physically sound male without children as the normative citizen. As a result, urban places were constructed around their needs. Hence it aimed to see the city from a women-centric perspective, identify an3009d address the challenges that women faced in accessing public transport, public health facilities, streets,

³ Only the improvements in the public bus system are discussed here as these might be more relevant to the project.
parks, cultural facilities etc. These issues were typically not addressed at national policy levels and the project aimed to expand the scope of women’s policy into urban life (UN-Habitat 2008). The project was divided into five major objectives of a Caring, Active, Prosperous, Safe and Convenient Seoul. Over 90 projects were proposed under these five themes.

The Women and Family Policy Bureau is the nodal agency for coordinating implementation across sixteen agencies / institutions within the Seoul Metropolitan Government. Each office selected projects to integrate a gender perspective, create four year specific action plans with the women’s policy department and report results to the Mayor every quarter. There was an annual evaluation of the projects and prizes are granted by the government to exemplary cases in each of the five categories. Finally, each district was encouraged to set up a WFCP contextual to its region (UN-Habitat 2008).

**Initiatives/ Projects**

- A matrix was created to identify the needs of a wide group of women in Seoul. The tool helped identify 15 groups that might not be catered to by existing policies and identified their needs. Additionally, guidelines were for women-friendly restrooms, parking lots, parks, roads and residential complexes and granted certifications (Seoul Metropolitan Government 2009).
- **Caring Seoul** supports social minorities and the child caring responsibilities undertaken by women. The child-care projects include increasing the number of public child-care centres, utilizing newly-built or closed government office buildings for these and increasing the number of dual-use facilities as public child-care centres and resident administration centres. It also includes aiding health insurance fees for children in child-care centres and installing child-care facilities like breast-feeding rooms, day-care centres as well as rest rooms in public places, cultural facilities, subway stations and government offices. The metropolitan government established 21 public child-care facilities in 2007 in Seoul.
- The **Work-conducive Seoul** policy aims to encourage economic activities, provide education and support programs for women. The project introduced provides on-line education programs for female business starters like the ‘mom-preneur’ business schools. Additionally, it provided child-care services for women in job training programs, offered more child-care leave in the public sector and a flexible working hour system for government officials.
- The **Prosperous Seoul** policy focuses on improving women’s access to cultural and leisure opportunities. It includes making women-friendly cultural facilities by increasing women’s rest rooms, establishing day-care centres and breast-feeding rooms in key institutions and flagship projects. Further, 30% of classes on cyber information education were assigned for women and children. The project also aims to set up web portals that provide comprehensive information about welfare, education, employment, cultural events and childcare information for women.
- The **Safe Seoul** policy aims to facilitate women’s safety through design of flagship residential complexes (for example, New Town Construction Project). Further, the policy focuses on ensuring safe travel for women at night, including women-only and women-driven taxis with an option to send information about the taxi to their family members through cellular phones. It is also planning a ‘daily-life safety experience program’ that enables women to prepare for emergency situations. In addition, it conducts research on the impact of urban pollution on women and provides solutions.
- The **Convenient Seoul** policy aims at making the city convenient for women. Online surveys indicated that women experienced most inconvenience in public restrooms, public transport, driving and parking, sidewalks, parks and public buildings. The numbers of toilets were increased in female restrooms in subway stations, new performance centres, stadia and parks. Additionally public rest rooms included diaper-changing tables, CCTV cameras and emergency bells at entrances along with improved lighting.
- **Infrastructure makeovers** - The government designated parking lots for women in public parking zones and improved lighting, installed more CCTV cameras and emergency bells in underground parking lots. It lowered the height of the sidewalk ledge, installed hump-type crosswalks, laid minimum

---

4 The policy supports social minorities - the elderly, the homeless, the disabled, migrant women and single-parent households – through ‘voucher plans for care givers for the elderly’, ‘establishment and operation of rehabilitation centres for the female homeless’, ‘support for children with disabled family members’, and ‘support for school meal helpers (UN-Habitat 2008).’
guidelines for street lighting at 30 lux and created resting areas separate from pedestrian walkways. The stabilizing handles in buses and subways were lowered and public transport facilities were made universally accessible. Installation of ticket gates for baby carriages in subway stations. Public parks included amenities such as nursery rooms, lost children protection rooms, emergency phones, CCTVs and improved lighting.

- The city planning committee included more women committee members to encourage women’s participation in policy-making. A pilot project including the facilities mentioned above was executed in Magok district.

The Citizen’s Evaluation of Administrative Services revealed that the percentage of women satisfied with the intervention increased from 68.2 percent in 2007 to 83.2 percent in 2008; and those who felt safe increased from 46 percent in 2007 to 70.3 percent in 2008.
Reports


Focus

Data from two cities Vishakhapatnam and New Delhi have been analysed to compare travel patterns of men and women. The paper concludes with possible interventions required to ensure safe and secure travel of women at land use planning level and street design level.

Findings

- Vishakhapatnam is the second largest urban agglomeration in Andhra Pradesh with a population of about 1.73 million (Census, 2011). 62.7% of men make their trips for the purpose of work while only 11% of trips by women were for work. Trips to places of worship (49%) and educational institutes (38%) made up for the majority of trips made by women. While the proportion of work trips among women increased with increase in income and share of religious trips decreased.
- 71% of all trips made by women in Vishakhapatnam were by walking. Bicycle trips are more among men than women across income categories.
- Survey done among low income household in Delhi show similar patterns with women more dependent on walking than men and less dependent on cycling and buses as a mode.
- Similar trends were also reported on studies conducted in Chennai in 2006 and Delhi in 2001.

The following conclusions were drawn in the study

- Women are more dependent than men for walking, irrespective of the income levels.
- Travel distances for women are generally smaller but the travel times are similar for both genders indicating ‘higher spatial accessibility’ for men.
- Land use planning projects which shift poor to the periphery of the city has a huge impact on accessibility to work opportunities for poor households. The impact is felt disproportionately higher by women of the households who have access to lower disposable incomes.

REPORT OF THE COMMITTEE ON AMMENDMENTS TO CRIMINAL LAW, JANUARY 2013, Justice J.S. Verma (Retd.), Justice Leila Seth (Retd), Gopal Subramanium

- “As a fundamental requirement, we strongly opine that the State should undertake the task of providing well lit roads, streets and other common spaces to the citizens. It is nothing but common sense that crime hides in darkness and eradication of darkness is an easy way to eradicate crime.”
- “…That lack of proper sanitation facilities also contribute to the commission of sexual crimes against women. Especially during the night hours when women have to go out of their houses to use sanitation facilities and these moments are abused by anti-social elements. Thus, there is a need to address the issue of provision of adequate sanitation facilities in villages and urban areas urgently.”
- “For the reasons afore-stated, we prohibit the use of black films of any VLT percentage or any other material upon the safety glasses, windscreens (front and rear) and side glasses of all vehicles throughout the country. The Home Secretary, Director General/Commissioner of Police of the respective States/Centre shall ensure compliance with this direction. The directions contained in this judgment shall become operative and enforceable with effect from 4th May, 2012.”
- All public transport vehicles which move after 5:30 pm until 7:30 am, every transport vehicle must have a security person.
- “The public transport vehicles must be increased, whether rural or urban areas and it is the state’s responsibility to make sure that there is adequate means of transport which will increase the level of security in respect women both during the day as well as night.”
In metropolitan towns the public transport vehicles must be
- Well lit during the nights
- Must have the drivers who are security vetted.
- For vehicles plying between 5.30 pm and 7.30 am in the morning, it is necessary that either a male or a female constable riding the bus in order to prevent any possibility of an assault on women.
- Display of bus numbers along with Name, age and address of the driver along with photograph and contact number
- CCTV cameras- it will be the duty of the constable (male or female) who is travelling in the bus to ensure that the CCTV is not tampered.
- Tamper a proof GPS system which is connected to central monitoring system to monitor if there is a deviation of the bus from the allotted route. The committee strongly emphasizes that the judgement passed in M.C. Mehta Vs. Union of India 5

- The local police should have a complete database of information regarding such personnel. Every State Government must have a computerised database with details of –
- It is necessary to have simple helpline numbers which can be dialled by the passengers whenever in need. Downloadable mobile applications may be developed so that citizens on one click can send signals to the police.
- Physical location of safe spaces should be centrally located with public services in close proximity and connected by public transport.

Gender and Urban Transport: Smart and Affordable (A Sourcebook for Policy-makers in Developing Cities), September 2007)

Focus

This source book for policy-makers in the developing countries discusses about the gender and urban transport go hand in hand and how can the urban transportation system in the developing countries can be made smart and affordable. Key Gender issues were highlighted.

Findings

- “The travel patterns are said to be one of the most clearly gendered aspects of life (Wachs, 1996)”
- “Women in urban areas usually tend to take more and shorter trips at more varied times. These trips are more expensive in terms of time and money.”
- “Women make more off-peak trips, travelling to more disperse locations. Women are associated with their reproductive work in maintaining the household. When they travel they tend to have multiple purposes and multiple destinations within one trip.”
- “Women require low-cost, reliable, and consumer-friendly, flexible, door-to-door service with many route options to meet their needs. Men’s travelling patterns are much more linear which are mostly origin-destinations centred on employment.”
- “Women have a lower incidence of vehicle use, and a higher incidence of walking.”
- “Women prefer more flexible service and have harder time during boarding and alighting, because either they travel with children and packages or because the steps are too steep.”
- “Overcrowding becomes a security issue for women as it leads to groping and inappropriate behaviour.” “Women are exposed to more vulnerability in terms of use of public space and this affects how they use public space, including transport.”

5 (1997) 8 SCC 770
Gender and Sustainable Urban Mobility, Thematic Study prepared for Sustainable Urban Mobility: Global Report on Human Settlements 2013, Deike Peters

“Women’s travel patterns are different from men’s and these differences are characterized by deep and persistent inequalities. Within any given urban setting, women have inferior access to both private and public means of transport while at the same time assuming a higher share of their household’s travel burden and making more trips associated with reproductive and caretaking responsibilities” (Peiters, 2013)

Focus

The focus is to understand the trends and conditions of gendered travel patterns and their transportation usage, differentiated by different travel modes. Particular focus was given to the Gendered perspective on various kinds of public transportation systems and highlights the impacts and challenges of that particular mode of transport system and attempt to derive some key recommendations made in the study to incorporate in the objective of the project.

Findings

- “Women travel shorter distances to work as well as other miscellaneous household’s related work as compared men in rural as well as urban setting.”
- “Women are typically seen travelling for getting children to and fro from school, and other miscellaneous household related tasks like shopping, medical visits, elder care or children’s after school activities”
- “Even, High instances of maternal mortality due to pregnancy related complications are directly linked to poor women’s non-access to reliable, on-demand motorized transport.”
- “The study clearly points that in developing countries like India, access to both motorized personal and public transport is less available particularly in the low income groups, the sustainability and desirability of relying on non-motorized transport needs to be somewhat questioned, especially in contexts where excessive walking puts a heavy physical strain and time burden on women who are already income and time poor.”
- “Women’ dependence is often on informal mode of transit like cycle rickshaws, auto rickshaws in Asia because of the affordability and convenience factor. Since women make a maximum number of multiple trips along their origin and destination, they can stop where ever they want through these kinds of transport.”
- “Safety and security in public transport are crucial issues which disproportionately affect women. Women are frequently subject to unwanted sexual contact in during public transit.” The study also points that women’s access to the overcrowded public transport may be additionally constrained in contexts where preferential boarding practices for men results in women being left behind. Instances like sexual harassment touch and pushes to women in such overcrowded vehicles highly take place.
- Older and low-income women mostly make and prefer their trips during the off-peak hours and perform various households related tasks like shopping, getting children from school, groceries etc.
- Informal motorized is an essential but an inferior mode of transport as compared to the formal mode of transit options. Overcrowding and unsafe riding conditions, unregulated fares, harassment, and preferential boarding and alighting is largely given to male passengers. It provides important, flexible yet illegitimate services to poor and middle-income urban residents in settings where formal services do not exist.
- Designing of Gender sensitive transit and transport infrastructures, introducing of women only public transport vehicles, family and women only parking spaces, Gendered balanced public signage, increasing of women employment/staff in transport are some of the key observations which the study points out.

Lessons/ Learnings

Infrastructure, usage of space and the nature of social institutions and policing are the prime factors governing women safety in public transport. The presences of certain environmental features in the
transportation setting (e.g., bus stop, train platform, parking structure) are generally associated with
greatest fear. These features include darkness, desolation, lack of opportunities for informal surveillance by
the general public or the residents of surrounding establishments, lack of maintenance, and poor
environment quality (Atkins 1989) (Valentine 1990). Thus it is important that public transport safety must be
guaranteed during the whole length of the trip i.e. on vehicles, during the waiting time, and on the routes of
access to stations and stops. Every access should be checked and improved. Planning and designing safe
transport systems for women therefore requires intervention at three levels viz. land use planning, street
designs and public transport infrastructure (Geetam Tiwari, 2014).

Given below is the summary of important lessons drawn from the case studies and literature reviewed.

**Vehicle Design**

Verma Committee Report on amendments to criminal law, January 2013, advocates the importance of
public transport vehicles being equipped well enough with technological modifications like installation of
CCTVs and GPS devices, to track the movements of the vehicle along the allocated route and keep an eye
on the anti-social activities especially against the women inside the bus while travelling.

**Help Lines**

Also complementing women’s helpline with making available this information on all buses along with
provision of paid phones on bus stops is seen as holistic measure that helps to make the overall service
safer for women. Having an integrated helpline which gives maximum importance to calls on sexual
harassment is a great initiative taken by BMTC, Bangalore in this regard.

**Infrastructure**

Absence of a public culture and domination of public spaces by men heighten women’s sense of insecurity.
Insecurity and fear however define how women negotiate public spaces both during the day and night.
Furthermore, time, place and purpose determine women’s access to public spaces (Safe Delhi Campaign,
New Delhi).

Design of public transport infrastructure which includes access to public transport stops, the design of the
stop, vehicle design should strictly be safety and security compliant. Lighting, good design, visibility at
stops and stations are some of the crucial components which create a feeling of security. Often crime takes
place in the dark; therefore also, it is necessary to make the public places facilitated with bright street lights.

Street Design should also be looked in from the safety perspective. Importance should be given to
pedestrians and cyclists, the two most vulnerable road users. Provision of better pedestrian facilities and
ensuring presence of street vendors (to improve social security) are among the key measures that should
be focussed.

Cities like Seoul have created manuals (guidelines) for restrooms, parking lots, walkways, parks, etc from
safety perspective, with public buildings and facilities serving as benchmarks. Certification or a “women-
friendly facility mark” is awarded to excellent facilities following an on-site inspection. Use of incentives to
promote women safety is another initiative under Seoul’s Women Friendly City Project.

**Scheduling**

To ensure safety after dark, every public transport vehicle which plies between 5.30 pm and 7.30 am
should have a constable (male or female) in the vehicle. This suggestion by Verma Committee, 2013 is
particularly important given that time plays an important role in determining how women access public
transport.

**Interdepartmental Coordination**

It would be most effective if the public transport agency coordinated with the local police to ensure that
action is taken against offenders. Making available patrolling vehicles which conducts random checks on
buses especially during the night and having special police vehicles which can respond to cases of harassment of women reported either by the bus personnel or the passengers on the helpline number can ensure that the use of public transport agency will be safer for woman.

**Trainings**

Training of staff and sensitizing them about women issues plays a very important role in ensuring safety of women passengers. Steps have been taken to make the bus personnel aware of women harassment and gender sensitization in multiple cities like Mumbai. Staff welfare activities also hold importance in this regard.

It is equally necessary to ensure that there are standard procedures to be followed and that the staff be trained about it. For this, involvement of different stakeholders is very important. For e.g. coordination with the Police is important to ensure action will be taken against offenders. Furthermore, the need of taking immediate action requires a direct connection between staff, the operational centre and the police. Similarly, partnership with women’s advocacy organizations and commuter’s forums can play an important role in ensuring better services for the people.

**Safety Audits**

Safety audits are a helpful tool to evaluate space from the perspective of those who feel unsafe and lead to improvements that reduce the risk. This has been extensively used in Delhi to evaluate safety of different public spaces. They act as a useful tool linking safety, design and planning and can greatly help in increasing awareness on violence against women and other vulnerable groups. However, Special attention required while carrying out safety audits in informal settlements, which have different planning standards and designs as compared to formal neighbourhoods. Involving stakeholders such as women’s advocacy groups and police can further help in obtaining better results.
ANNEXURE 3 – SAFETY AUDITS

Introduction

In order to assess the safety and security of the routes and the bus stops located along them, Safety Audits of the selected pilot corridors and bus stops along these routes were conducted by means of a mobile based application called ‘Safetipin’.

Safetipin is a map-based mobile phone application. It consists of a set of 9 parameters that together contribute to the perception of safety. The nine parameters include - lighting, openness, visibility, crowd, security, walk path, public transport, gender diversity and feeling of safety. Each of the nine parameters shows four options to choose from. Each option is given a rating from ‘0’ to ‘3’, less rating is indicative of lesser safety. Once all parameters have a selection, the Audit screen has a different look, where the extent of yellow indicates a higher score within an option. After pinning the location and adding photographs and comments (optional), this can be uploaded. Each audit results in a pin on the specific location where the audit was performed along with the time and date of the audit. Every audit is denoted by three different colours depending on the input: Red is for unsafe, amber for less safe and green for safe.

Methodology

These audits were conducted along the 8 selected pilot corridors of the city. These included 2 standard bus routes and 3 minibus and tata magic routes each. On each of the selected corridor, audits were made at each 150 metre distance and at all the bus stops falling along the route to study and understand the safety concerns and issues. Thus, audits were conducted more in the form of a line survey. The process and distance of each of the next audit location was so selected because it is estimated that the scenario both in terms of perception and infrastructure provision changes at distance of around 150-200 metres. Hence audits were done at each 150 metres to capture the situation at each of the given location and point of audit. In this manner a total of 845 safety audits were conducted across the city, this includes the audits of the bus stops as well.

For the purpose of carrying out the audits, 2 students were selected, one of them being essentially a female student. Hence, at each point along the corridors and the bus stops two audits were conducted so as to have evident results.

Based on the average scoring of each of the audit conducted which is out of 10, bus stops along each of the selected pilot corridors were classified under 3 sections i.e. unsafe (scoring less than 3 out of 10), less safe (scoring between 3-7 out of 10) and safe (scoring more than 7 out of 10).

Apart from this 10 stretches along the selected corridors with least safety score were also identified. These were areas with rated lowest in terms of the 9 safety parameters.

Findings

Suggested stretches- Immediate Action

Three stretches which scored the least on Safety audits conducted on Public transport routes in the city using the Safetipin audits are listed below.
1. Kasturba Nagar Bus Stop to Ayodhya Nagar Bus Stop including stretch from Vijay Market Bus Stop to Barkhedi
   Route: SR5 & MB 5
   Length: 9.00 km.

2. Civil Hospital bus stop to SBI Chauraha bus stop
   Route: TR1 and SR5
   Length: 5.21 km.

3. Airtel Office, Malviya Nagar  to DB Mall
   Route: SR5
   Length: 3.56 km.
Priority Bus stops

List of priority bus stops is given below. The bus stops listed under priority 1 are the ones which scored less than 3 out of 10 on the safety score parameters i.e. were marked in red pins. The bus stops listed under priority 2 are the ones which have scored between 3 to 7 out of 10 and were marked by amber pins.

Priority 1 bus stops

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S.No.</th>
<th>Bus Stop</th>
<th>Route</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Prakash Tarun Pushkar Bus stop</td>
<td>TR1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Kasturba Hospital Bus Stop</td>
<td>SR5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Carrier College Bus Stop</td>
<td>SR5 &amp; TM1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Sanchi Dairy Bus Stop</td>
<td>SR5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Pipani, Sector C, BHEL</td>
<td>MB5 &amp; TM1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Allahabad Bank Bus Stop</td>
<td>MB5 &amp; TM1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Old Subhash Nagar Colony, Raisen Road</td>
<td>MB5 &amp; TM2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Hoshgabad Road</td>
<td>MB7 &amp; MB11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Hoshgabad Road</td>
<td>MB7 &amp; MB11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Jail Road, Zone 1 MP Nagar</td>
<td>MB7 &amp; MB11</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Priority 2 bus stops

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S.No.</th>
<th>Bus Stop</th>
<th>Route</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Aakriti Eco City Bus Stop</td>
<td>TR1 &amp; MB11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Ishwar Nagar Bus Stop</td>
<td>TR1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Kamla Park Road, Taliaya</td>
<td>TR1, SR5 &amp; TM3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>GRP Colony, Zone-II, Maharana Pratap Nagar</td>
<td>TR1, MB7 &amp; MB11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Pump House Bus Stop Bairagarh</td>
<td>TR1, SR5, MB11 &amp; TM3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Tilak Nagar Bus Stop</td>
<td>TR1 &amp; MB11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Halalpur Bus Stop</td>
<td>TR1, SR5, MB7, MB11 &amp; TM3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Main Road 1, Nishat Colony Bus Stop, Arera Hills</td>
<td>TR1 &amp; SR5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Char Imli Bus Stop, Bittian Market</td>
<td>TR1 &amp; MB11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>St Hirdaram Chouraha Bus Stop</td>
<td>TR1, SR5, MB11 &amp; TM3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Sundarvan Garden Bus Stop</td>
<td>TR1, SR5, MB11 &amp; TM3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Collectorate Bus Stop</td>
<td>TR1, SR5, MB7, MB11 &amp; TM3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Rohit Nagar Bus Stop</td>
<td>TR1 &amp; MB11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>Bhim Nagar Slums Bus Stop, Arera Hills</td>
<td>TR1 &amp; SR5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Housing Board Colony Bus Stop, Kohefiza</td>
<td>TR1, SR5, MB11 &amp; TM3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>Bairagarh Bus Stop</td>
<td>TR1, SR5, MB11 &amp; TM3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>Vijay Nagar Bus Stop, Lalghati</td>
<td>TR1, SR5, MB11 &amp; TM3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>Sultania Road, Kohefiza</td>
<td>TR1, SR5, MB11 &amp; TM3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>Sai Board Bus Stop</td>
<td>TR1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>Red Cross Hospital Bus Stop</td>
<td>TR1 &amp; SR5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>Civil Hospital Bus Stop, Bairagarh</td>
<td>TR1, SR5, MB11 &amp; TM3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>Lalghati Bus Stop</td>
<td>TR1, SR5, MB11 &amp; TM3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>Anna Nagar Bus Stop, Service Road, Zone-II, Maharana Pratap Nagar</td>
<td>TR1 &amp; MB11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>BHEL Bus Stop</td>
<td>SR5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>ISBT Bus Stop, Habib Ganj</td>
<td>SR5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>Lily Talkies Bus Stop, Sultania Road</td>
<td>SR5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Scoring

**Safety Audit Rating**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Route/Parameter</th>
<th>Light</th>
<th>Open</th>
<th>Visible</th>
<th>Crowd</th>
<th>Security</th>
<th>Path</th>
<th>Transport</th>
<th>Gender Usage</th>
<th>Feeling</th>
<th>Avg. Score</th>
<th>Weighted Avg. Score</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>MB11</td>
<td>0.82</td>
<td>0.87</td>
<td>0.93</td>
<td>1.08</td>
<td>1.04</td>
<td>1.36</td>
<td>0.98</td>
<td>1.05</td>
<td>1.10</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>1.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MB5</td>
<td>1.01</td>
<td>0.94</td>
<td>1.06</td>
<td>1.17</td>
<td>1.12</td>
<td>4.18</td>
<td>0.97</td>
<td>1.07</td>
<td>1.06</td>
<td>1.04</td>
<td>1.04</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MB7</td>
<td>0.90</td>
<td>0.93</td>
<td>0.95</td>
<td>1.02</td>
<td>0.95</td>
<td>1.06</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>0.95</td>
<td>1.05</td>
<td>0.98</td>
<td>0.99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SR5</td>
<td>1.02</td>
<td>1.01</td>
<td>1.09</td>
<td>1.04</td>
<td>0.94</td>
<td>1.19</td>
<td>1.11</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>1.06</td>
<td>1.05</td>
<td>1.04</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TR1</td>
<td>0.74</td>
<td>0.87</td>
<td>0.94</td>
<td>1.04</td>
<td>1.01</td>
<td>1.48</td>
<td>0.93</td>
<td>1.01</td>
<td>1.12</td>
<td>0.97</td>
<td>0.97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TM1</td>
<td>0.82</td>
<td>0.73</td>
<td>0.91</td>
<td>1.04</td>
<td>1.28</td>
<td>1.77</td>
<td>0.81</td>
<td>1.14</td>
<td>0.86</td>
<td>0.90</td>
<td>0.90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TM2</td>
<td>1.01</td>
<td>0.99</td>
<td>0.98</td>
<td>1.05</td>
<td>0.95</td>
<td>1.46</td>
<td>0.99</td>
<td>0.86</td>
<td>1.10</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>1.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TM3</td>
<td>0.86</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>1.20</td>
<td>1.07</td>
<td>1.04</td>
<td>1.02</td>
<td>1.01</td>
<td>1.06</td>
<td>1.10</td>
<td>1.02</td>
<td>1.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AVG</td>
<td>0.89</td>
<td>0.91</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>1.06</td>
<td>1.01</td>
<td>1.25</td>
<td>0.98</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>1.06</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>1.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TR1/SR5</td>
<td>0.85</td>
<td>0.94</td>
<td>1.01</td>
<td>1.04</td>
<td>0.97</td>
<td>1.35</td>
<td>1.01</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td>1.09</td>
<td>1.01</td>
<td>1.01</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Tata Magic Route 1 has scored least amongst all the selected routes followed by TR1 and MB7. Both have scored least for lighting, openness and visibility.
Security has been rated lowest across all modes by both men and women followed by gender usage and walk path. This shows that there is absence of security both public and private which takes away from the safety of the place. Also the gender usage as per the audits is not diverse i.e. there are more men in sight as compared to that of women. Absence of proper walk path also was highlighted in the audits.
ANNEXURE 4 – DRIVERS AND CONDUCTORS TRAINING

Objective of training

The primary objective of the training was to create awareness among participants about gender based violence and making them responsible and sensitive about rights and safety of women. Following points were emphasised during the training.

- Make the drivers and conductor more sensitive towards women passengers.
- To explain the legal accountability and responsibility of conductors and drivers against gender based violence.
- To discuss the steps to be taken to make public transports safer option for travelling.
- To make the employees of public transport more aware and responsible about women rights.
- To make drivers and conductors aware about gender discrimination.

Process

- Group Discussion
- Role play
- Film screening

Activity Details:

- Introduction of participants

Participants were asked to introduce themselves. This was done to get the basic information of the participants like how long have they been working with organization, where have they been working before, reasons of switching, place of residence etc.

- Introduction of programme and expectation mapping of participants

The basic purpose of the training was explained to the participants, information about their expectations from such trainings was also gathered under this activity.

- Key objective of the programme

This activity was concerned with detailed objective sharing and explanation of the training module and taking consents from participants for the same.

- Thematic session: Myths & facts on violence

All the participants were divided into two groups and were given a situation where they had to identify the violation of rights and violence in bus and a Power point Presentation on myth and definition of violence was shared with the participants afterwards to clear their doubts that arised from the thematic session.

- What's your experience about the violence in bus (any incidence which you have seen?)

Participants were asked to share their experience / particular event of violence and their response during those events. This was done to understand their response mechanism towards such crimes in buses. Prior to this a few minutes were given to them to recall their experiences.

- What is sexual harassment: perception, legal ground, punishments, and duty of driver /conductor
Message was given by means of short films that were shown to the participants, which was followed discussions on what the participants understood from the movies and what learning/message they thought was there in it. For explaining the legal grounds presentation was made to them.

- **How we will deal with sexual harassment: our role and challenge**

This activity was focussed on understanding the key challenges faced by participants while dealing with harassment and teasing incidents on the bus. Following this they were given information on how should they deal and handle the same. Police was invited to give information on what are the safest ways of handling such situations without disturbing other passengers and also on the legalities involved.

- **Way forwards: How we behave with women passengers**

Short movies were shown to the participants and tips and messages from resource persons were shared. Participants took oath to ensure safe travel for women in their buses.

**Discussion (1st Round)**

**Concerns of Participants**

During the training it was asked to the participants that what kind of incidence of eve-teasing and sexual harassment takes place in their buses.

- Participants replied that usually these sorts of incidence don’t take place in their transport, but seldom it occurs and we protest it instantly.
- Many of male passengers occupy the females reserved seats and when they asked to leave they start arguing.
- It has also been seen that some women/ girls want to sit with their male friends or companion if they are prohibited to do so they also starts debating.
- Usually females cover their faces and we can’t recognize them, and if any mishap occurs to them we are helpless and unable to do anything.
- Sometimes pick pockets try to steal goods of passengers or women if we stop them, there is a risk of get attacked by pick pockets, and police is also reluctant towards such incidents.
- Police also believes that we are the sole responsible for any criminal activity that takes place in our buses and police department harass us.
- Even company does not support us in such incidents.

**Inputs by Resource Person (Trainer from SANGINI)**

- It was said by resource person that if any harassment or misbehaviour occurs inside the public transport than under public transport than under the legal procedure of law the conductors and drivers are totally responsible that why they cannot ignore such types of incidents .
- They focused on fundamental rights of women, which are enshrined in the Constitution of India from Article 12 to article 35.
- They focused on difference between gender andsex, sex is biological and but gender are social phenomenon which is created by society.
- It is clearly enshrined under article 354 of Indian Penal Code that if a male tries to touch a females without her consent or comments her or gazes her then he will be chargeable of Crime against Women . The culprit can be imprisoned minimum up to 3 months and maximum up to 3 years of imprisonment .
- We are obliged to secure women in public transport as we can stop other passengers to do there is a provision that if conductors or drivers are involved in such activities they can be charged under section 354 of Indian Penal Code.
- We have to pay due attention and aware ourselves that there would no such incidents or harassments occur against female passengers and will try to safeguard them if these kind of incidence happens.

During this discussion the participants express that we are a responsible citizen and it is our responsibility to respect the dignity of women.

**Discussion (2\(^{nd}\) Round)**

**Concerns of Participants**

During the training problem participants shared their problems which are as follows:

- If we stop the passengers not to misbehave or not to sit on reserved seats they start argue and violence and it is concern of our and security of other passengers also
- In cases of misbehaviour and sexual harassment on public transport we are helpless from police department.
- We have a fixed route for running our buses in case we stop any goon to our transport they may attack with their criminal friends.
- We do not get support from our company.
- There are many places where passengers refuse to pay the fixed fare and they start arguing and start mentioning their relation with police officers or ministers.

**Inputs by Resource Person (Trainer from SANGINI)**

After listening and understanding the concern of participants, resource person said that:

- If any passenger misconduct or misbehave with female passenger we will take our transport to the police station and report to the available officer.
- It is our duty that if we are away from police station then we will report to patrolling party of police department.
- The resource person came from the police department trained the drivers and conductors the tactics of self defence when it is require and if somebody attacked them.
- If any person intentionally attacked the bus conductor or driver, report to the nearest police station. Police will take immediate and strict action.
- Regarding the regular bus route, it would be helpful to know about the local offenders or criminals and we would not let them to enter into our buses.
- The moral is we will have to pledge and protest that we will oppose such criminal acts and secure women and we should be committed to them.

**Role play:**

A role play program was organised. All the participants were dived into 3 three groups and they were supposes to invite the female passengers explaining the quality and special features of their buses along with the suitable reason that why a woman should use their transport for the journey.

The participants discussed the topic among themselves after the ‘role play’ and the following points came out:

- Our bus is safe for the transportation
- Our bus Service is punctual and always run on time.
- We don’t let anyone to bug /inebriate in our transport.
- It is our responsibility to take you safely to your destination.
• We have reserved quota of seats for women.
• We have fixed bus fare /tariff.
• We won’t let anyone to misbehave with women passenger.

This role play was based on what participants think about women’s safety and none of participants raised the point of safety during the role play but they were only concerned about time taken, speed limit and less fare of their buses.

**Film Show**

Clippings on violence against women and eve-teasing in public transports were presented before the participants and the scenario was discussed with them along with the solution of these problems. They actively participated with proper involvement in the activity. Some views were shared by the participants too. The name of the movie was “A step ahead”, “That after every day” and “Zor se Bol”. These two film clippings sensitize them towards the striking issues of female passengers.

**Commitment by participants**

In the last session of workshop the drivers and conductors were asked about the steps for betterment and making the journey safer. Their answers were as follows:

• Seats allotted to women will be kept reserved
• Men will not be allowed to stand near the reserved seats
• Conductors will not be allowed to incline on reserved seats while collecting fare.
• We have a speed limit, and we will maintain it.
• We will stop any kind of misbehaviour towards women passengers.
• We will stick the bills mentioning women rights
• We would not hesitate in calling police in calling the police if necessary.
Feedback Form’s Responses by Drivers and Conductors Before and After the Training Session:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Questions</th>
<th>Before training</th>
<th>After training</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Do you think the short dresses wore by women is the primary reason behind eve-teasing</td>
<td>Yes 80%  No 20%</td>
<td>Yes 15%  No 85%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Is only Police obliged women safety</td>
<td>Yes 50%  No 50%</td>
<td>Yes 20%  No 80%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ensuring women safety and maintain her dignity should be the duty of every man</td>
<td>Yes 85%  No 15%</td>
<td>Yes 100%  No 00%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Our duty is to maintain the time table of buses not to protect the passengers</td>
<td>Yes 65%  No 35%</td>
<td>Yes 00%  No 100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The driver or conductor is not responsible for any mishap in their transport</td>
<td>Yes 60%  No 40%</td>
<td>Yes 00%  No 100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Women should not travel alone at night for their own safety</td>
<td>Yes 75%  No 25%</td>
<td>Yes 10%  No 90%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>One big reason behind eve-teasing is weakness of women</td>
<td>Yes 35%  No 65%</td>
<td>Yes 05%  No 95%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Police always harass bus conductor and driver for any incident in their transport</td>
<td>Yes 90%  No 10%</td>
<td>Yes 20%  No 80%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I know my duty in any case of eve-teasing and harassment</td>
<td>Yes 30%  No 70%</td>
<td>Yes 90%  No 10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Outcome</td>
<td>Yes 20%  No 80%</td>
<td>Yes 100%  No 00%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Training Schedule

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Activity</th>
<th>Process detail</th>
<th>Expected outcome</th>
<th>Method</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>10 Minutes</td>
<td>Welcome and registration</td>
<td>In written/ format</td>
<td>List of participants for record</td>
<td>One by one</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20 Minutes</td>
<td>Introduction of participants</td>
<td>Participants ask to introduce themselves. Requested them to provide little bit more about their background too.</td>
<td>Understanding and profiling of participants.</td>
<td>One by one. In the front of dice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10 minutes</td>
<td>Introduction of programme and expectation mapping of participants</td>
<td>Ask to the participants</td>
<td>Understanding and exclusion of participants concerns and expectation in the programme.</td>
<td>In chart paper by facilitator</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10 minutes</td>
<td>Key objective of the programme</td>
<td>Objective sharing and taking consents from participants</td>
<td>Trust building about the programme and giving ownership to all</td>
<td>Reading from the chart and taking consents</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>60 Minutes</td>
<td>Thematic session: Myths &amp; facts on violence</td>
<td>Divide participants in two groups and give them two situation where they have to identify the violation of rights and violence in bus</td>
<td>Participants able to identify the rights of passengers and can be sensitive towards violence.</td>
<td>Role play and debriefing, followed by Open discussion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>60 Minutes</td>
<td>What's your experience about the violence in bus (any incidence which you have seen )</td>
<td>Provide time to participants there they can recall and share their experience / particular event of violence and their response</td>
<td>Understand the key personal value of the participants and recognise their effort</td>
<td>Sharing and appreciation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Lunch break</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Duration</td>
<td>Activity/Event</td>
<td>Description/Goal</td>
<td>Format</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>------------------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>60 minutes</td>
<td>What is sexual harassment: perception, legal ground, punishments, duty of driver / conductor</td>
<td>Case presentation and discussion</td>
<td>Increase Knowledge and awareness of participants about the existing law and their duty</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>60 minutes</td>
<td>Case study, discussion, presentation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30 minutes</td>
<td>How we will deal with sexual harassment: our role and challenge</td>
<td>What are the key challenge they face during the dealing with harassment / teasing / misbehave. What can they do in these situation</td>
<td>Understanding the practical situation / problem of drivers, when they intervene in real situation and collective agreement on slandered response</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30 minutes</td>
<td>Individual sharing and open discussion</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20 Minutes</td>
<td>Way forwards: How we behave with women passengers</td>
<td>Given some tips and model role</td>
<td>Increase their personal commitment to prevent harassment of passengers particularly women</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20 Minutes</td>
<td>Oath taking</td>
<td>Presentation and oath</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10 Minutes</td>
<td>Valedictory session</td>
<td>Thanks giving and feedback</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Purpose of the campaign

This campaign is an activity under Capacity Building and Awareness Creation part of the project - Pilot Initiative for Women’s Safety in Public Transport in Bhopal. The campaign aimed at creating awareness about women’s safety in public transport in Bhopal. The campaign was named “Break the Silence” and was jointly organised by Bhopal City Link Limited (BCLL), Sangini - Gender Resource Centre and EMBARQ India. It was organised for one week, starting from 8th March, 2015 to 15th March, 2015.

Activity Calendar

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S.No</th>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Activity</th>
<th>Place</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>08/03/2015</td>
<td>Celebration of Women’s Day at Raahgiri</td>
<td>Shahpura Lake</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>08/03/2015</td>
<td>Show at Vividh Bharti</td>
<td>Shyamla Hills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>09/03/2015</td>
<td>Press Conference</td>
<td>Apsara, Ravindra Bhavan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>10/03/2015</td>
<td>Advertisement about the campaign in radio</td>
<td>F.M. stations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>11/03/2015</td>
<td>Discussion with students</td>
<td>Unique IAS Study Circle, Mata Mandir</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>12/03/2015</td>
<td>Discussion with college teachers and students</td>
<td>Govt.Maharani Lakshmi Bai College (girl’s college)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>12/03/2015 to 15/03/2015</td>
<td>Exhibition at bus stops, role play, stickers, badge distribution, oath taking and signature campaign</td>
<td>All mentioned squares/junctions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>13/03/2015</td>
<td>Police Talk Show</td>
<td>Police Training and Research Institute (PTRI)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>13/03/2015</td>
<td>Discussion with college teachers and students</td>
<td>BHEL College and BITS College</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>14/03/2015</td>
<td>Discussion with college teachers and students</td>
<td>Sant Hirdaram Girl’s College, Bairagarh and Rudra IAS Academy, M.P. Nagar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>15/03/2015</td>
<td>Exhibition, snake ladder game, oath taking and signature campaign at Raahgiri (Closing Ceremony)</td>
<td>Upper lake</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>09/03/2015 to 15/03/2015</td>
<td>Announcements by traffic police</td>
<td>All mentioned squares/junctions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>09/03/2015 to 15/03/2015</td>
<td>Display by BCLL</td>
<td>In all red buses</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Activity Details

1. Launch on International Women’s Day (8th March)

The campaign started on International Women’s Day i.e. 8th March at Raahgiri day. Two activities were carried out on this Day, one was the Snake and Ladder Game and the other was Signature campaign.

The popular Snake and Ladder game was transformed into an informative game by attaching a message with every ladder to stop violence against women and on every bite of snake we attached a social evil. For example towards the mouth of snake “violate women” was written, whereas “stop violence against women” was written towards the ladder.

Raahgiri Day proved to be an appropriate platform as people from all age groups and social backgrounds gathered in huge numbers and enthusiastically participated in the snake & ladder game. Signature campaign was followed by the snake & ladder game. People wrote their views and messages on the flex and boards and also discussed about crime and safety of women in public transports and public places.

2. Press Conference (9th March)

Second most important activity of campaign was Press conference which was held on 9th march at Ravindra Bhavan. This press conference was addressed by EMBARQ India; Sangini Gender Resource Centre and Bhopal City Link Limited (BCLL). Around 40 media persons from both print and electronic media attended the press conference. The main motive of this press conference was to share the purpose of the campaign and the activities to be carried during the campaign. The press conference marked the official start of the campaign and received extensive coverage in all the leading daily newspapers.

3. Radio Broadcast and talk shows on All India Radio, Vividh Bharti and 92.7 Big FM

To spread the message of campaign to larger number of people and to different strata of society, radio channels both local and national were approached. Talk shows and discussions on the campaign and issues related to women security and discussed issues related to women’s safety and security in public
transport and the legal aspects of the same were broadcasted on All India Radio, Vividh Bharti and 92.7 Big FM.

During the whole campaign, 92.7 Big FM came forward to join hands in campaign with Sangini and took the responsibility to spread the message information through their medium.

4. Talk show and Seminars with students at colleges and educational institutions

To reach out with the message of the campaign to the students, especially the girl students who extensively and frequently use public transport as a medium to commute to colleges and coaching centres and to discuss the issue of women’s security, talk shows and seminars were organised in different educational institutes of the city. Apart from the discussions, in order to sensitise male students, short films based on the issues were also screened as a part of the seminar. The seminars were covered by 92.7 Big FM and after the seminar students were made to fill a questionnaire to understand their views in detail.

The following educational institutes were covered under the activity:

- Unique IAS Study Circle (Coaching Class) Bhopal – 11th March, 2015
- BHEL College Bhopal – 13th March, 2015
- BITS College Bhopal - 14th March, 2015
- Sant Hirdaram College Bhopal - 14th March, 2015
5. Exhibition at bus stops and activities in buses

As a part of the campaign, exhibitions were organised at 26 different bus stops in the city. The bus stops selected for conducting the exhibition were the ones which have maximum women passenger volumes so as to have greater reach of the campaign among women passengers. These were determined by count analysis undertaken as a part of the situational analysis of the study. The exhibition was themed on crime against women at public place and public transport.

Along with the exhibitions, a signature campaign was also conducted at each of the 26 bus stops; passenger signed and pledged to break silence against any crime against women and girls. People who came forward to sign and pledge were given badges with campaign message, as a gesture of motivation.
Apart from the activities on the bus stops, skit play was performed in moving red buses by the Campaigning team. The team discussed about the laws and the problems face by passengers and suggested them quick action that should be taken to stop such acts. During the exhibition the campaigners also distributed informative pamphlets and pasted stickers in public transport buses and vehicles with helpline nos. and laws on women security to spread the awareness.

6. **Announcements by traffic police at traffic signals**

Traffic Police also actively supported the campaign and as a part of the campaign activity, announcements on women’s safety and security in public transport and the campaign were made by traffic police personnel’s at various important junctions and squares of the city. The announcements were made throughout the campaign duration.
7. Police talk Show

On 13th March, 2015 a police talk show was organised with the collaboration of CAW Department of Police, Sangini, BCLL and EMBARQ India at Police Training And Research Institute, Jehangirabad, Bhopal.

In the talk show ADG (AJK) Dr. Sujoy Lal Thousen, DIG Srinivas verma, AIG of police (CAW) Mrs. Kiranlata kerketta, ASP Traffic Mrs.Shalini Dixit and Shailendra Chauhan (ASP crime) were present from police department.

Citizens, students, slum dwellers and members of civil society actively participated in the discussion and voiced their issues and concerns with the police representatives. The talk show was attended by around 200 people including media personnel’s.

8. Oath Taking (Closure ceremony of the campaign)

On 15th March, 2015 i.e. on the last day of campaign an oath taking ceremony was conducted at Raahgiri day along with the exhibition and signature campaign. Shri Surjeet Singh Chouhan, chairman of Nagar Nigam Bhopal addressed the oath taking program.
People present at Raahgiri day took the oath to break their silence in opposition to any form of crime against women and will stand for women’s safety and security.

All the activities of the campaign were covered live and in detail by 92.7 BIG FM. Besides, the campaign throughout the week got extensive coverage in all the leading newspapers. Apart from the on ground activities to create awareness, suggestions and feedbacks from citizens were also gathered through the campaign. Some of the suggestions given by people have been listed below.

**Suggestions**

- The front gate of buses should be strictly reserved for ladies only
- There should be a small gate between the seats reserved for ladies and unreserved seats and the gate is to be used by conductors only.
- The CCTV’s should be in working condition with a proper monitoring team. In case of mishap instant action should be taken with the help of Police force.
- Mini buses are still a preferred medium of public transport so few seats must be reserved for ladies in minibuses as well and a gate should be there between reserved and unreserved seats as suggested for BCLL buses.
- Some mini buses drivers play vulgar and loud music tracks on buses, this practice must be stopped.
- Some drivers and conductors are drunk while driving. Traffic police should take action against them. Regular checking of drivers and conductors should be done to protect women from eve-teasing
- Verification of drivers/conductors of mini buses should be done; if possible there should be a female worker in mini buses.
- Conductors stand in the gate of buses and try to touch female passengers thus standing on gates should be prohibited.
- Overloading in mini buses/tata magic and red buses must be stopped.
- Red buses, tata magic and mini buses are supposed to be available frequently and at regular intervals which at present is not there. A proper time table should be made and strictly followed.
- Most importantly the time table of buses should be displayed on bus stops, so that availability of transport is maintained.
Oath:

हम शपथ लेते हैं कि

- हम महिलाओं के प्रति सम्मान का, नजरिया रखेंगे तथा महिलाओं
  द्वारा रखेंगे स्वतंत्रता तथा गरीबी का की सुखांता
- हमारे जीवन में महिलाओं के साथ होने वाली हिंसा के,
  खिलाफ अपनी खामोशी तोड़ेंगे
- हम न हिंसा करेंगे और न ही कहले देंगे,
- हमयदि किसी महिला के साथ हिंसा होने देखते हैं तो तुरंत इसका,
  विशेष करेंगे तथा उसकी शिकायत करेंगे
- हम स्थलों पर न ही सर्दियों महिला सुक्कट तिप्पणियाँ निकालेंगे,
  का उपयोग करेंगे और न ही कहले देंगे
- यदि कोई महिला अपने साथ हो रही हिंसा का विशेष कहती है तो हम,
  उसका साथ देंगे
Questionnaire on Sexual Harassment in Public Places/ Public Transport

1. What kind(s) of harassment / eve teasing have you faced? (Tick all applicable)
   - Verbal (comments, whistling etc.)
   - Physical (touching, feeling up etc.)
   - Visual (staring, leering, gesticulating etc.)

2. Have you ever reacted/ taken action when someone has harassed/eve teased you?
   - Yes
   - No
   - If yes, how? (Tick all applicable)
     - Retaliated verbally
     - Retaliated physically. If yes, what did you do?
     - Walked away
     - Asked others for help
     - Asked police for help

   (If yes, did the police respond?)
   - Yes
   - No

   How long did they take?

   Others:........................................................................................................................................

3. Has anyone ever helped you when you were being harassed?
   - Yes
   - No

   If yes, how? (Tick all applicable)
   - Called the Police
   - Confronted the harasser
   - Got support from people around
4. Do you know that there are laws against street harassment/ eve teasing?

☐ Yes

☐ No

5. Many women often take precautionary measures to ensure their safety. Please tick the precautions you take/ your family asks you to take for your safety as a woman. (Tick all applicable)

☐ Avoid certain public space.

☐ Avoid going out alone

☐ Avoid wearing certain clothes, which may seem provocative

☐ Carry items such as pepper spray/ safety pins etc

☐ I do not take any precautions as I feel safe in the city.

☐ None of the above.
Media Coverage - Campaign

Times of India

‘Safe city’ campaign kicks off

Bhopal: In a shocking instance three in ten men using city’s public transport, suggest that women are equally responsible and some 10% said women faced harassment for dressing ‘inappropriately.’ This was stated in a safe city initiative survey.

Safe city initiative is aimed to make city’s public transport safer for women. A week-long campaign to make public transport safe for women was kicked off on Monday. Safe city initiative is backed by UK funding agency Department for International Development (DFID), Bhopal City Link Limited (BCLL), Embarq India and local NGOs.

To curb violence against women is the primary aim of the week-long drive, said the BCLL representative.

“Shocking as it is, through the survey we want to create awareness, sensitize people and educate women on how to use helpline in case of harassment,” he said.

Embarq India representative, Azra Khan said, “Bus Rapid Transit System (BRTS) has emerged as a cost-effective, flexible and environmentally sustainable form of public transportation. Our objective is to make BRTS and other public transport ride safer for women.” Organisers will interact with commuters, schools and colleges, drivers, conductors and traffic police through various events planned for the coming week.

Dainik Bhaskar

महिला हिंसा से मुक्त शहर के लिए अभियान आज से
Free Press

People’s Samachar

Nav Duniya
8 pilot corridors have been selected for the study which includes one trunk route, one standard route and 3 mini-bus and 3 tata magic routes. The pilot corridors were so selected based on the following reasons:

**Trunk Route 1 (TR1) -**

TR1 has a highest ridership i.e. 11,652 passengers/day (EMBARQ India 2013) with a route length of 25 km. Further the corridor runs along major attractors and generators of the city of Bhopal, through the old city and across a range of land-uses like the Chirayu Hospital, Moti Masjid, New Market, and the Habibganj railway station. Apart from this the route is co-terminus with a number of bus routes over a considerable length and therefore improvements in its bus infrastructure would improve experiences for close to 35-45% of the commuters and hence have been selected for the study.

**Standard route 5 (SR5) -**

SR 5 operates from Chirayu Hospital to Handicapped College. It is taken as another pilot route as it has the second highest number of passengers (10,753 passengers / day) (EMBARQ India 2013). The route passes through the old city as well as connects peripheral areas such as BHEL Township in the east. It is co-terminus with TR1; hence any improvements on TR1 will also benefit this route and hence is selected as the one of the routes for study.

**Mini Bus Routes -**

Three mini bus routes (MB11, MB20 and MB7) have been selected as pilot corridors along with the trunk and standard route. These three mini-bus routes serve stations adjacent to major attractors and generators of the city - Barkatullah University, old city, Bairagarh railway station and even run to the suburbs of the city and hence have been selected for the study.

**Tata Magic Routes -**

Three tata magic routes (Bairagarh to Rang Mahal; Board Office to Patel Nagar; Bus Stop to J K Road) have been selected as pilot corridors along with the trunk and standard route and mini bus routes. These three routes also serve stations adjacent to major attractors and generators of the and even run to the suburbs of the city and hence have been selected for the study.

The figures below show the existing BCLL buses, mini buses and tata magic routes in Bhopal.
Tata Magic Routes

Source: Draft Final Report: Comprehensive Mobility Plan of Bhopal, 2012